



## OTTAWA TAX PAYERS ADVOCACY GROUP

*"The Silent Majority is Silent No More"*

### **The Ottawa Taxpayer Advocacy Group Releases Detailed Plan for 2 Year Budget Freeze – No New Money**

1. 2 Year Budget Freeze – No New Money Approach– 5 minutes
  2. Monthly Budget Variance Reports – 5 minutes
  3. Debt / Pay As You Go- 5 minutes
  4. Administration, Executive & Service Administration Costs – 5 minutes
  5. Consulting & Legal Services– 10 minutes
  6. Compensation (Salary, Overtime, Benefits) – 20 minutes
  7. Outsourcing (Transit, Housing, Parks & Recreation, Others)- 10 minutes
  8. Transit– 10 minutes
  9. Police / Fire / Paramedics– 10 minutes
  10. Bylaw– 10 minutes
  11. Libraries– 10 minutes
  12. Downloaded & Non Mandated Services (Health, Housing, Emp. & Fin. Assis., Long Term & Child Care) - 10 minutes
  13. Hydro Ottawa / Ottawa Community Housing– 10 minutes
  14. Drinking Water, Solid & Water Waste– 10 minutes
  15. Parks, Recreation & Sports– 10 minutes
  16. Capital Costs– 10 minutes
  17. Roads, Traffic, Building Permits & Other Core Services Operating Costs – 10 minutes
  18. IT, Clerk, HR, Finance, Property Mgt., Planning, Community Funding, other Non Core Services – 10 minutes
-

---

## 2 Year Budget Freeze – No New Money

This issue is important as it will affect budgeting for the next 5 years. This Summit is a discussion on how spend 12 billion dollars in way that will ensure long term property tax and user fee affordability, while maintaining our quality of life.

If the Council voted for a 2 year budget freeze, can this be done with limited impact to core services? If your answer is NO, please use the appropriate level of detail to prove your case.

Detailed below is how to find \$243 million by a 10% reduction in the following budgets, upon review of answers on impact to service, we will propose \$200 million in specific expenses that can be used to fund a 2 year budget freeze and any new projects.

1. Executive / board / management costs \$75.8 million
2. Administration costs \$246.9 million (excluding hydro) e.g. It, clerk, hr, finance, property mgt., planning etc
3. Non departmental costs \$68.2 million (excluding hydro, housing) e.g. Sick leave banks, retiree costs, benefits adjustment, election expense, self insurance, mpac, tax rebates etc
4. Administration costs for core and non core services \$202.7 million e.g. Research, recruitment, costing, reporting, communication, planning, billing, expenditure management, advertising, printing, stationary, promotional items, furniture, procurement, maintenance, cleaning, knowledge management, travel, hospitality, memberships, record keeping etc.
5. Legal & consulting services \$247 million in 2009 (excluding hydro, housing)
6. Some capital costs \$416 million
7. Core services \$2 billion (5% cut) e.g. Drinking water, solid & water waste, police, fire, paramedics, roads, traffic, building permits etc
8. Non core services \$150 million e.g. Library, community funding, environmental, bylaw etc

When commenting on the impact of a budget freeze, please be guided by the following priority list. The lower the priority the higher the opportunity to shoulder budget reductions or freezes.

---

	<b>Services Listed In Order of Priority</b>	<b>operating cost</b>	<b>Total Program</b>
1	Drinking Services	51,230	125,833
2	Solid Waste	72,734	66,569
3	Waste Water Services	43,991	126,472
4	Hydro Operations, Maintenance & Administration (2009)	72,000	
5	Public Health	49,825	48,209
6	Crime Prevention		400
7	Ottawa Police Service	246,782	249,558
8	Ottawa Fire Services	132,744	122,995
9	Ottawa Paramedic Services	72,504	64,991
10	Office Of Emergency Management / Integrated Public Safety	2,444	6,464
11	Surface Operations - Integrated Road & Water	135,886	125,701
12	Engineering & Technical Services		13,916
13	Transportation Services Rural & Agriculture		
14	Transportation Services		
15	Traffic & Parking Operations	42,659	14,026
16	Building Code Services	15,673	15,306
17	Transit Services	384,910	386,536
18	Employment & Financial Assistance	216,749	234,454
20	Long Term Care	49,350	49,152
21	Childcare	95,349	95,315
22	Housing	143,073	142,327
23	Ottawa Public Library	40,366	38,981
24	Parks Recreation Services	99,925	143,697
25	Parks & Sports Buildings & Grounds		131,507
26	French Language Services		
27	Committee Of Adjustment		944
28	Infrastructure Services	5,666	26,417
29	Transportation Planning		3,346
30	Building Code Services - Other Permits & Compl Rep	619	
31	Cultural Services & Community Funding	45,268	
32	By-Law & Regulatory Services	18,740	17,965
33	IT Services	46,441	45,125
34	It Productivity Driven		
35	Fleet Services	654	61,005
36	Forestry Services (Public Works)		10,062
37	Planning Branch (Construction, Rural)		3,324
38	Planning & Growth Management	14,521	20,780
40	Economic & Environmental Sustainability	6,696	3,530
41	Environmental Sustainability		2,355
42	Employee Services	20,831	14,666
43	Organizational Development & Performance		6,036
44	Communications & Customer Service	12,462	11,446
45	Service Excellence Program	1,654	
46	Legal Services	6,813	
47	Financial Services	31,021	41,721
48	Real Property Asset Management	57,060	7,236
49	Corporate Planning & Performance Reporting	1,158	
50	City Clerk	15,880	28,864

---

## City Response

The residential tax rate in Toronto is lower than Ottawa's due to the fact that home prices are higher on average than in Ottawa. Higher values require a lower rate to generate the same level of taxation revenues.

In addition, there are two other reasons why rates are lower:

1. The Province provides more funding to the City of Toronto to assist in the costs of social housing and general welfare assistance. In addition, both the riders of the Toronto Transit system and the Province fund more of the cost of public transit in Toronto than in Ottawa.
2. The residential class in Toronto bears a lower percentage of total property taxes than Ottawa's residential class.

This is due to the Province's property tax legislation and Toronto's decision to keep business property taxes high.

### Follow Up Question: 2 Year Budget Freeze;

What we really need is a detailed city budget. **The 2010 Comp Non Comp file has a good format but lacks lower level detail** which would be separate item categories in SAP, so it must be possible to get us a lower level report for each cost centre.

For example if we wanted to know what the police spends on printing or office furniture, or what libraries spend on video games, we have no clue. In each department we **listed the costs we are looking for, that would give you an idea of the level of detail we want**. At the moment 20% of our questions are addressed, if we can get detailed costs our satisfaction level will jump to 80%. We will then not be asking staff the impact of a 10% cut in a specific department, as we will have the information to answer that question.

### Monthly Variance Report

In 2008 Ottawa was charged taxpayers 50% above the Canadian average for property tax and utility bill for a single detached home. This was the worst record in Ontario and Canada.  
[http://www.edmonton.ca/business/documents/PropertyTax\\_Report\\_2008revised.pdf](http://www.edmonton.ca/business/documents/PropertyTax_Report_2008revised.pdf)

The bus garage discussion started at about 38 million dollars and is likely to be completed at a cost of 100 million dollars. The fire department recently announced that they are already over budget, other departments have failed to achieve efficiencies. If there were monthly budget variance meetings, Council would be able to take preventive decisions as opposed to being informed after the fact. Efficiency targets have simply become a way to hide spending growth and raid the reserves to pay for targets that managers have no intention of meeting. The intent of legislative reserve requirements is emergency savings and should not be used as a tool to hide the real spending increase.

While a 2 year budget freeze should make departments more efficient, Council should have a monthly variance report that includes attrition, hiring and job classification changes, consulting fees, overtime, different types of benefits, Top 35 capital projects and Top 15 departments by operating cost. Council should spend at least a couple of days to discuss the reports and pass motions that will reduce costs. Is there any reason why Council should not have such a reports on a monthly basis? If staff were asked to implement this, how long will it take to start producing the reports?

City Response:

In response to a similar comment made by OTAG last year, the following was provided which dealt with municipal comparisons.

012 Budget Inquiry - Holmes.do...  
018 - Response Budget Inquiry ...

---

City Response: In response to a similar comment made by OTAG last year, the following was provided.

In addition, City Council at its meeting of March 24, 2010 approved the following motion with respect to positions that become vacant due to retirement:

*"That staff routinely analyze each position that will become vacant due to retirement looking at the job description, compensation level and whether work could be consolidated with another position and report to the Corporate Services Economic Development meeting on the results of such analysis on a quarterly basis."*

Results of the first quarter review indicate that 55 positions became vacant due to retirement. Thirty of these positions have been permanently filled, the remainder are either in the process of being filled, redesigned or still under review by the Manager. It should be noted that as a result of the Manager's review of position requirements and subsequent compensation reviews to date, two have resulted in the creation of positions at a lower compensation rate and two at a higher compensation rate.

### **Debt / Pay As You Go**

According to the Frontier Institute we have a poor record in Ontario, in 2007:

Net Financial Assets / Household Average for Ontario \$1,284, Ottawa - \$1,225

Liabilities / Household Average for Ontario \$3,417, Ottawa \$5,768, we are worth 68.8% less than our counterparts in Ontario.

Long-term Debt / Household Average for Ontario \$1,106, Ottawa \$1,377,

<http://www.fcgp.org/images/publications/52.%202008Dec%20LGPI.pdf>

2002 total debt plus other liabilities \$1,406,534,931

2008 total debt burden plus other liabilities \$2,429,074,464

<http://csconramp.mah.gov.on.ca/fir/ViewFIR2009.htm>

This means the City debt has grown by over 1 billion dollars, can you explain the growth in debt? There is an argument for borrowing to buy appreciating assets, but the city's net worth is negative, so please provide a detailed breakdown of the reasons for this debt? Similar to the former city of Nepean, what are the implications of implementing a pay as you go process?

### **City Response**

An explanation for the increase in the City's liabilities from 2002 to 2008 is provided as Document 1 and a listing of the outstanding debt for 2008 is provided as Document 2.

The City does utilize capital reserves to fund a portion of its capital program on a pay-as-you-go basis. Federal and provincial gas tax revenues are also used to cash finance capital projects and development charge revenues are used to fund growth related projects. Debt financing is only used on projects that meet the eligibility criteria. Moving towards an increased use of cash is a policy issue for future Council to decide and will have tax implications.

---

---

Document 1

**Total Liability Comparison: 2002 to 2008**

The total liabilities of the City of Ottawa for the years comparing 2002 with 2008 are in the table below:

	2002	2008	Variance
Accounts payable and accrued liabilities	277,449,000	364,476,913	87,027,913
Deferred Revenue	216,814,000	638,549,000	421,735,000
Long - Term Liabilities (Capital Leases)	-	89,806,000	89,806,000
Landfill closure and post-closure	9,784,000	13,687,596	3,903,596
Post employment benefits	225,617,000	326,375,312	100,758,312
Net Long-Term Debt	423,569,000	553,231,000	129,662,000
Mortgages payable	253,302,000	221,516,000	(31,786,000)
<b>Total Financial Liabilities</b>	<b>1,406,535,000</b>	<b>2,207,641,821</b>	<b>801,106,821</b>

The major variances are made up of the following:

- Overall increase in trade accounts payable
  - Increase in deferred revenue is due to
19. Three programs not in existence in 2002. They are the Investment in Ontario Act, Gas Tax and Municipal Infrastructure Investment Initiative. These account for \$151 million.
  20. Higher development charges due to increases in the development charges (\$203 million)
  21. Increases in the Cash in Lieu of Parkland and Parking (\$14 million)
  22. Increases in general overall deferred revenue (\$53M)
    - Two capital leases that didn't exist in 2002. One is for an administration building and the other is for a paramedic services building
    - Increase in post employment benefits due to increase in workforce. FTE's for 2002 was 12,597 and 2008 was 14,320
    - Increase in net long term debt due to
  23. Public private partnership debt
  24. Higher debt issuances in the areas : roads, transit, environmental services

The City of Ottawa continues to experience growth. Population increased by 8 per cent and the number of households increased by 11 per cent between 2002 and 2008. There were also a number of new programs in place from the federal and provincial level of governments, which were not in place in 2002. Two new capital leases were entered into after 2002, one for an administration building and the other is for a paramedic services building. Public Private Partnership (P3) debt also did not exist in 2002. The number of full time equivalent employees in the City of Ottawa increased by 14 per cent accounting for higher post retirement benefits.

Total debt makes up only 4.7 per cent (2008) of the City's own source revenue, which is consistent with council targets and is within the Province of Ontario's guidelines. In 2002 this figure was 6.4%, which is 1.7 per cent higher.

---

---

## Document 2

Functions	2008	
	\$000	% of O/S Debt
General Administration	24,006	4.3%
Governance (Councillors Offices)	788	0.1%
Fire	3,078	0.6%
Police	16,601	3.0%
Protective Inspection	-	-
Roads	248,590	44.9%
Parking	1,395	0.3%
Public Transit	80,298	14.5%
Wastewater Treatment	20,246	3.7%
Water Supply and Distribution	73,065	13.2%
Waste and Recycling Services	1,873	0.3%
Public Housing	-	-
Social and Family Services	41,400	7.5%
Parks and Recreation	27,748	5.0%
Libraries	6,118	1.1%
Planning and Development	8,025	1.5%
Health	-	-
<b>Total Net Long Term Debt</b>	<b>553,231</b>	<b>100.0%</b>

### **Follow Up Questions**

Nepean & Mississauga were able to operate debt free, yet our debt has grown by 1 billion since amalgamation. We feel that debt is being used as tool to defer taxes to the next generation. It is also our opinion that money that could be used for infrastructure projects is being used to absorb to growth in compensation, which leads to the necessity to borrow for every capital project. We have this opinion because of enclosed post amalgamation stats that show that compensation is growing much faster than revenue. The only way to make up the difference is debt.

- Total Salary Wages up 54% to \$940 million
- Employment benefits are up 83% to \$193.8 million
- Accumulated sick leave is up 72% to \$92 million
- User fees are up 30% to \$583 million
- Property taxes are up 29% to \$1,068,869,387
- Grants from the Federal and Ontario governments are up 27% to \$391 million
- Number of taxpaying households, up 17% to 365,770

What is the debt per tax paying household in 2010? If we freeze that ratio by what % will this action cause taxes to rise in 2011?

The largest contribution to the growth in debt was deferred revenue which grew by \$421 million in 6 years. Can you explain further? Is money we have received for a service we have to deliver in the future? Is that money seating in a bank account?

With reference to office space, what is the operating cost per employee in 2002 and 2010? Growth should be self funding, so it should not be a reason for an increase in debt. Is growth self funding?

---

---

With reference to the response about an increase in P3 debt, does the City have a process to pay down debt with a savings or revenue from a P3 project? A P3 should either be reducing costs or increasing revenue, in either case what happens to the extra cash?

### **Administration, Executive & Service Administration Costs**

Ottawa spent 1.8% of the operating budget on the finance department; this is 55% more than a similar percentage for the finance department in Winnipeg. It is therefore hard to understand why we needed a consultant to tell us how the HST will impact city finances. The focus for this section is Administration costs like finance or about 25% of the budget for each department.

1. Executive / Board / Management Costs \$75.8 million
2. Other Services Administration Costs \$246.9 million (excluding hydro)
3. Non departmental costs \$68.2 million (excluding hydro)
4. Administration costs for core and non core services \$202.7 million

What does each of the services below spend on each of the following 25 costs: research, recruitment, training, cost engineering, finance analyst, general reporting, performance measurement, corporate communication and online content, Administration, planning, billing and revenue collection, expenditure management, advertising, executive, printing, office stationary, promotional items, office furniture, computers, procurement, facilities maintenance and cleaning, knowledge management & record keeping, management of federal & provincial legislation, travel, hospitality, memberships.

If all administration budgets or services below are frozen or cut by 10%, there will be limited or no impact to service. If you have a different opinion, kindly review each line item below and use the appropriate level of detail to prove which service will be impacted and how?

### **City Response**

To respond to the analysis submitted by OTAG, a definition of "administration" must first be established. Although there are many ways to define what constitutes an "administrative" cost, in general, most sources found on the internet describe it in the following way:

*"Administrative costs are all executive, organizational, and clerical costs associated with the general management of an organization rather than with manufacturing, marketing, or selling."*  
(Source: BusinessDictionary.com)

Previous City Responses to questions from Council on the costs of administration (or general government) have focused on the corporate support departments that provide support to the front-line operating departments of the City who deliver the services and programs to residents along with the offices of the City Manager, and the two Deputy City Managers. Using the above definition, the offices of the operational general managers and directors have also been included along with budgets for the governance function. Attached as Document 1 is a chart that chart summarizes the administrative costs under 4 categories – Governance, City Corporate Management, Corporate Support and Operational Management.

The analysis submitted by OTAG attempts to extract administrative costs from the City's budget and classify them into 4 categories by either taking a fixed percent (3% or 10%) of the budget for a particular branch / program or in some cases, 100% of the budget. Attached as Document 2 are the administrative items as submitted by OTAG and numbers each item from 1 to 102 for ease of reference along with a brief staff comment. In some cases, staff were not able to identify the source of the numbers presented by OTAG. No comments have been provided on items related to Ottawa Hydro and Business Improvement Areas (BIA's). Items that are included in the City's definition of "administration" have been highlighted on the schedule.

---

The following provides a high level general comment of the items identified by OTAG under their 4 categories.

**A) Admin for Services Operating Cost - \$202,743**

Applying a fixed percentage to the budget of an operational program or taking 100% of the budget, to arrive at a value that represents "administration" cannot be done in this manner. The vast majority of the programs listed from #1 to #21, support the delivery of the service provided to residents. The budgets of some of these branches include expenditures that are not "administrative", as per the definition outlined above. In the case of #2, the majority of costs are transfer payments to residents who are on social assistance. In #3, the majority of costs are transfers to housing agencies. Item #16 represents debt servicing costs and contributions to capital reserve funds.

**B) Non Service Admin Costs Operating Cost - \$246,958**

The budgets of a number of services listed in this category are ones that are included in the City's definition of "administration". The remainder represents services that are linked to the provision of service to residents.

**C) Non Departmental - \$68,191**

None of the items listed are "administrative".

**D) Executive / Board % of total budget - \$75,878**

The budgets of a number of services listed in this category are ones that are included in the City's definition of "administration".

<b>Document 1</b>	
<b>Department / Branch</b>	<b>2010 Budget Exp. \$000</b>
<b><u>1) Governance</u></b>	
City Council	10,354
- Auditor General	1,765
Police Services Board	708
Library Services Board	38
	<b>12,865</b>
<b><u>2) City Management</u></b>	
City Managers Office	341
Deputy City Manager Office - City Operations	872
Deputy City Manager Office - Infra. Serv. & Comm. Sust.	1,100
Police Executive Command	1,505
Chief Librarian	875
	<b>4,693</b>
<b><u>3) Corporate Support</u></b>	
City Manager Functions	3,831
Real Estate Partnership Development Services	6,885
Financial Services	33,751
City Clerk & Solisitor	22,919
Organizational Development & Performance*	11,789
Human Resources	13,848
Information Technology	41,445
Communications*	4,802
Community Sustainabilty - Economic Development	2,700
	<b>141,970</b>

<b>4) Operational Management - Office Budgets</b>	
<b>Infrastructure Services &amp; Community Sustainability</b>	
- Director of Community Sustainability	223
- General Manager Infrastructure Services	504
- General Manager Environmental Services	258
- General Manager Planning & Growth Management	555
Director Building Services	653
- General Manager Transit Services	662
Performance Measurement	1,179
City Operations	
- General Manager Parks & Recreation	563
- General Manager Emergency & Protective Services	270
Paramedic Chief	254
Fire Chief	287
By-law Chief	324
Integrated Public Safety Chief	774
- General Manager Public Works	792
- General Manager Community & Social Services	290
- Medical Officer of Health	420
Police Services	
Operational Support Functions	22,104
Library Services	
Operational Support Functions	1,609
	<b>31,721</b>
<b>Total Administrative Costs</b>	<b>191,249</b>
<b>Total City Budget</b>	<b>2,515,814</b>
<b>% of Administrative Costs of Total Budget</b>	<b>7.6%</b>
* Reflects reorganization of Client Services from Communications to ODP	

### Follow Up Question Administration, Executive & Service Administration Costs

Our question is that if each item was cut by 10%, what will be the impact on services? Ottawa spent 1.8% of the operating budget on the finance department; this is 55% more than a similar percentage for the finance department in Winnipeg. So if we cut the Finance department budget by 10% what is the impact?

25% is our estimate for admin costs within each department. This means that a 10% cut in admin is actually a 2.5% cut in the entire budget.

Non service admin costs and non departmental costs are stand alone departments, so there is no confusion on what we mean. In each case what is the impact of a 10% budget cut?

Executive costs are self explanatory and each time you see 3% that is our estimate for executive costs. In each case what is the impact of a 10% budget cut?

---

In order to describe the impact kindly use the following terms; research, recruitment, training, cost engineering, finance analyst, general reporting, performance measurement, corporate communication and online content, Administration, planning, billing and revenue collection, expenditure management, advertising, executive, printing, office stationary, promotional items, office furniture, computers, procurement, facilities maintenance and cleaning, knowledge management & record keeping, management of federal & provincial legislation, travel, hospitality, memberships, executive management.

Alternatively, what does each of the 147 items in your response spend on the items above? (See general comments) Without a detailed budget we have to assume that each department spends 25% of their budget on admin. This is an industry norm. If the City does not agree, then tell us what % of each department budget is used on the items listed above?

Area Identified as "Administration" by OTAG	Amount \$000	Staff Comment	Included in City Definiton of Administration
<b>A) - Admin for Services Operating Cost - \$202,743</b>			
1- <u>Ottawa Police Service</u> (Admin Reporting, HR, Training, Outreach, Communication, Court) 36,319	36,319	Operational support (Finance, IT, HR, Legal, Planning, Communications)	22,104
2 - Employment & Financial Assistance Admin (10% estimate) 23,445	23,445	Total budget \$233.759m / Transfer payments \$177.5m / General Manager Office shown in #88	
3 - Housing Admin (10% estimate) 14,333	14,333	Total budget \$142.2m / Transfers \$134.2m	
4 - Parks & Sports Buildings & Grounds Admin (10% estimate) 13,151	13,151	Total budget \$131.5 (gross) - \$58.6m net after recoveries / Material, contracts, fleet costs = \$75.4m / General Manager office budget shown in #58	
5 - Roads & Traffic Maintenance Admin (10% estimate) 12,570	12,570	Total budget \$113.3m / Materials, contracts & fleet costs = \$72.8m	
6 - Drinking Water Customer Service 12,206	12,206	Program budget \$12.206m - direct service delivery	
7 - Transit Services, Performance Measurement, Marketing & Customer Services, Service Design 10,662	10,662	Marketing & Service design direct service delivery / Performance Mgt included in admin	1,179
8 - Parking Operations, Parking, Off Street 10,603	10,603	Total Parking budget \$14m / fully funded by parking revenues - no tax impact / Direct service deleivery	
9 - Parks Recreation Services Admin (10% estimate) 10,532	10,532	Direct service delivery / General Manager office budget shown in #54	
10 - Ottawa Fire Services Communication & Operational Support 8,890	8,890	Direct service delivery / Fire Chief office budget	287
11 - Ottawa Public Library Planning & Governance 8,121	8,121	Excluding Board and Chief Librarian office budget	1,609
12 - Waste Water Services Water Customer Service 8,032	8,032	Direct service delivery	
13 - <u>Hydro Operations</u> , Main. & Admin (2008) Admin (10% estimate) 6,813	6,813	N/A	
14 - Ottawa Paramedic Services Admin (10% estimate) 6,474	6,474	Direct service delivery - Chiefs office shown in #92	
15 - Public Health Foundational Standards 6,337	6,337	Direct service delivery	
16 - Solid Waste Non Departmental 5,368	5,368	Total budget \$5.368m - includes budget for debt charges and contributions to capital reserve fund - no admin.	
17 - Community & Protective Services Childcare Admin 3,045	3,045	Direct service delivery	
18 - Long Term Care, Support, Outreach 2,721	2,721	Direct service delivery	
19 - Building Code ServicesAdmin (10% estimate) 1,531	1,531	Total budget \$15.3m gross @10% = 1.531m / \$19.3m revenues from fees / Office of the Chief Building Officer shown in #102	
20 - Committee of Adjustment 944	944	Fully recovered from fees - direct service delivery	
21 - Office of Emergency Management Admin (10% estimate) 646	646	Total budget \$6.464m @10% = \$0.646m - Integrated public Safety Chief office budget shown in #95	
	<b>202,743</b>		25,179

<b>B) - Non Service Admin Costs Operating Cost - \$246,958</b>			
22 - IT Services 45,125	45,125	Included in City's definition of Administration	41,445
23 - Financial Services 41,721	41,721	Included in City's definition of Administration	33,751
24 - City Clerk & Legal 28,864	28,864	Included in City's definition of Administration	22,919
25 - Infrastructure Services 26,417	26,417	Delivers City capital program	
26 - Planning & Growth Management 20,780	20,780	Supports City operations and capital planning / General manger office budget shown in #75	
27 - By-Law & Regulatory Services 17,965	17,965	Direct service delivery	
28 - Employee Services 14,666	14,666	Included in City's definition of Administration	13,848
29 - Communications & Customer Service 11,446	11,446	Included in City's definition of Administration	10,555

<b>Area Identified as "Administration" by OTAG</b>	<b>Amount \$000</b>	<b>Staff Comment</b>	<b>Included in City Definiton of Administration</b>
30 - Forestry Services (Public Works) 10,062	10,062	Direct service delivery	
31 - Real Property Asset Management 7,236	7,236	Included in City's definition of Administration	6,885
32 - Organizational Development & Performance 6,036	6,036	Included in City's definition of Administration	6,036
33 - Economic & Environmental Sustainability 3,530	3,530	Included in City's definition of Administration / excludes transfer payments	2,700
34 - Transportation Planning 3,346	3,346	Supports City operations and capital planning	
35 - Planning Branch (Construction, Rural) 3,324	3,324	Direct service delivery	
36 - Environmental Sustainability 2,355	2,355	Included in City's definition of Administration	
37 - Service Excellence Program 1,654	1,654	Unable to locate quoted number in 2010 Budget	
38 - Corporate Planning & Performance Reporting 1,158	1,158	Unable to locate quoted number in 2010 Budget	
39 - Fleet Services 654	654	Direct service delivery	
40 - Building Code Services - Other Permits & Compl Rep 619	619	Direct service delivery	
	<b>246,958</b>		<b>138,139</b>
<b>C) - Non Departmental - \$68,191</b>			
41 - Sick Leave Banks 5,920	5,920	Contractual provision rquired by collective agreements	
42 - Retiree Costs 21,376	21,376	Benefit coverage required by collective agreements	

43 - Benefits Adjustment 75	75	In-year adjustments to benefit plans	
44 - Election Expense 1,125	1,125	Annual contribution to Election reserve fund. Used to fund elections costs every 4 years	
45 - Self Insurance 7,976	7,976	Account for insurance claims, insurance premiums	
46 - MPAC 11,921	11,921	Mandatory payment to MPAC for providing assessment services	
47 - Tax Rebates & Remissions 19,102	19,102	Manadatory payments to fund vacancy / charitable rebate programs and assessment appeals	
48 - BIA 696	696	NA	
	<b>68,191</b>		-
<b>D) - Executive / Board % of total budget - \$75,878</b>			
49 - Elected Officials 10,851	10,851	Budgets for all elected officials	10,354
50 - Ottawa Police Service 7,925	7,925	Ottawa Police Services Board governance \$708k plus Executive Command \$1505	2,213
51 - Employment & Financial Assistance 7,034 est: 3% of program	7,034	Gross budget \$233.759m @ 3% = \$7.012m - comment provided in #2	
52 - Housing 4,270 est: 3% of program	4,270	Gross budget \$142.327m @3% = \$4.270m - comment provided in #3	
53 - City Manager 4,219	4,219	City Manager office budget \$0.341m plus corporate support \$3.831m	4,172
54 - Parks & Sports Buildings & Grounds 3,945 est: 3% of program	3,945	General Manager of Parks & Rec office budget	563
55 - Surface Operations - Integrated Road & Water 3,771 est: 3% of program	3,771	Unable to locate quoted number in 2010 Budget	
56 - Community & Protective Services Childcare 2,859 est: 3% of program	2,859	Total budget \$95.315m @3% = \$2.859m - comment provided in #17	
57 - <u>Hydro Operations</u> , Maintenance & Admin (2008) 2,044 est 3% of operating	2,044	NA	
58 - Deputy Manager Public Works 2,006	2,006	General Manager Public Works office budget	792
59 - Executive Director Business Transformation 1,902	1,902	Unable to locate quoted number in 2010 Budget	
60 - Fleet Services 1,830 est: 3% of program	1,830	Fleet Services costs are charged to the departmental users of fleet & equipment - comment provided in #39	
61 - Auditor General 1,765	1,765	Total budget of AG's office	1,765
62 - Drinking Services 1,602	1,602	General Manager Environmental Services office budgets (rate supported)	258
63 - Long Term Care 1,475 est: 3% of program	1,475	Direct service delivery	

Area Identified as "Administration" by OTAG	Amount \$000	Staff Comment	Included in City Definiton of Administration
64 - Public Health 1,446 est: 3% of program	1,446	Medical Officer of Health office budget	420
65 - Cultural Services & Community Funding 1,358 est 3% of operating	1,358	Direct service delivery	
66 - Deputy Manager- Planning, Construction, Environment 1,349	1,349	Unable to locate quoted number - DCM PGM office budget \$1.100m	1,100
67 - Deputy Manager Operating Resource 1,250	1,250	Unable to locate quoted number in 2010 Budget	
68 - Ottawa Public Library 913	913	Ottawa Library Board governance & Chief Librarian office budget	913
69 - Deputy Manager Operations 872	872	Deputy City Manager - City Operations office budget	872
70 - City Clerk & Legal 712	712	Included in #24	
71 - Transit Services 662	662	General Manager Transit Services office budget	662
72 - Waste Water Services 619	619	Direct service delivery	
73 - Parks Recreation Services 592	592	General Manger office budget	
74 - Solid Waste 564	564	Direct service delivery	
75 - Planning & Growth Management 555	555	General Manager Planning & Growth Management office budget	555
76 - Organizational Development & Performance 547	547	Included in #32	
77 - Financial Services 538	538	Included in #23 above	
78 - Infrastructure Services 504	504	General Manger Infrastructure Services office budget	504
79 - IT Services 460	460	Included in #22 above	
80 - Building Code Services 459 est: 3% of program	459	Direct service delivery	
81 - Traffic & Parking Operations 421 est: 3% of program	421	Direct service delivery	
82 - Ops, Engineering & Technical Services 417 est: 3% of program	417	General Manager Public Works office budget / included in #58 above	
83 - IT Productivity Driven 395 est 3% of operating	395	Unable to locate quoted number in 2010 Budget	
84 - Employee Services 343	343	Included in #28 above	
85 - Communications & Customer Service 334	334	Included in #29 above	
86 - By-Law & Regulatory Services 324	324	By-law Chief office budget	324
87 - Forestry Services (Public Works) 302 est 3% of operating	302	Total budget \$10.062m @3%= 302k / Direct service delivery	
88 - General Manager Social Services 290	290	GM Community & Social Services office budget	290
89 - Ottawa Fire Services 287	287	Fire Chief office budget	
90 - Real Property Asset Management 284	284	Included in #31 above	
91 - Deputy Manager- Community & Protective Services 270	270	General Manager Emergency & Protective Services	270
92 - Ottawa Paramedic Services 254	254	Paramedic Chief office budget	254
93 - Environmental Sustainability 223	223	Director Community Sustainability office budget	223
94 - Legal Services 204 est 3% of operating	204	Included in #24 above	

95 - Office of Emergency Management / Integrated Public Safety 194 est: 3% of program	194	Integrated Public Safety Chief office budget	774
96 - Economic & Environmental Sustainability 106 est: 3% of program	106	Total budget \$3.530m @3%= 106k / Included in #33 above	
97 - Transportation Planning 100 est: 3% of program	100	Total budget \$3.346m @3%= 100k / Comment provided in #34 above	
98 - Planning Branch (Construction, Rural) 100 est: 3% of program	100	Total budget \$3.324m @3%= 100k / Comment provided in #35 above	
99 - Service Excellence Program 50 est 3% of operating	50	Unable to locate quoted number in 2010 Budget	
100 - Corporate Planning & Performance Reporting 35 est 3% of operating	35	Unable to locate quoted number in 2010 Budget	
101 - Committee of Adjustment 28 est: 3% of program	28	100% recovered by fees / Comment provided in #20 above	
102 - Building Code Services - Other Permits & Compl Rep 19 est 3% of operating	19	Director Building Services office budget	653
	<b>75,878</b>		<b>27,931</b>
<b>Total Administration: OTAG / City Definition</b>	<b>593,770</b>		<b>191,249</b>

---

## Consulting & Legal Services

This question is with reference to the outsourcing of services for skills that already exist within the City. In principle reducing the workforce and outsourcing should reduce costs, but the City did not reduce the workforce by 10% at amalgamation, nor did they remain stagnant. On the contrary, total compensation has grown from \$716 million in 2001 to 1.2 billion in 2010 or about 67%. The perception created by an increased use of consultants is that we are not getting value for the higher head count and compensation / benefits. Outsourcing should not be allowed unless it can be proven that the required skill does not exist within the City or the City's workforce is reduced by 10%. Staff with these skills simply have to prioritize their work load better, some private sector organizations have a 1 year back orders back log.

In 2009 the City spent about \$247 million on outsourced legal and consulting services. A 2 year budget freeze or 10% reduction in outsourcing will have limited or no impact on service. If you have a different opinion, please the appropriate level of detail to prove which service will be impacted and how?

We are questioning the rational for \$5.7 million in legal fees and \$3.9 million dollars in consulting services listed below. Please review each item, do the skills for services below exist within the City? If you had used city staff to do the work, what would be the opportunity cost?

Does the legal department have a financial risk / common sense cost benefit analysis before going to court? Or does the City have a cart Blanche to litigate all disputes? Does the City have a higher threshold for going to court in cases where they need to go outside for expertise?

Is there a reason we are spending \$75,000 on gym shorts for fire fighters and not other city employees and taxpayers?

With reference to the consulting cost for street furniture consultants, cow on roof top, marketing Ottawa consultant and the \$70,000 consulting fees on the types of transportation, is there no one in the City with the skills to do the work?

### City Response

The procured items included in the above total included gym shorts, gear bags, turtle necks, T-shirts, caps and boot liners in accordance with the Ottawa Professional Fire Fighters Association collective agreement.

### City Response

The following City Responses are provided to the four specific examples referenced by OTAG.

#### 1. Street Furniture

As the City had not previously embarked on an Integrated Street Furniture study, the specific expertise was not available internally.

#### 2. Cow on the Roof Top

Roof-top signs are prohibited throughout the City and have been prohibited since the early 1960's. Although the Council motion referred to the one sign at one specific location, an amendment to permit one roof-top sign would result in the repeal of the prohibition with the result of such signs being installed on roofs city-wide. Thus, a review to permit one roof-top sign requires reconsideration of the City's approach to regulating this type of sign, and requires staff to consider or identify all associated issues and impact of an amendment. In reviewing 2010 workload, priorities and staffing availability (essentially one policy officer), the conclusion reached was that in order to comply with Council direction to report back by year end, the services of a consultant needed to be engaged.

---

---

### 3. Marketing Ottawa

Staff was unable to identify the referenced item from the list provided.

### 4. Transportation consultant (Cost of Travel Model)

This type of work requires a special expertise in transportation planning, economic and software developing. The consulting team who undertook the previous two studies was comprised of transportation engineers, system analyst and software developer.

## City Response

To address the comments made in the preceding paragraph, the distinction between "consultants" and "professional Services" must be made. The City's purchasing by-law contains the following definitions:

- "Consulting Services" means assistance to management, including but not limited to the areas of strategic analysis, organizational design, change management, policy development, feasibility studies and other services intended to assist decision making within the organization;
- "Professional Services" means services requiring the skills of professionals for a defined service requirement or for a specific project related deliverable including but not limited to the areas of engineering, architecture, design, planning, information technology, financial auditing and fairness commissioners;

The use of professional services is an important budgetary requirement to ensure the successful and timely delivery of the numerous capital works approved by Council. These funds are required to purchase the various specialized services that the City does not have within the staff complement; in many instances because it is not economically feasible to keep a permanent complement of these specialized resources. In other instances, the funds are required to supplement existing staff resources in order that the projects can be completed.

At amalgamation the organizational model approved for the delivery of capital projects required the extensive use of external engineering services. This has proved cost effective for the city.

In City Response to a Council inquiry, the General Manager of Infrastructure Services provided a presentation on the use of internal versus external resources in the delivery of capital works as part of the "Competitive Services Delivery Review" (CSDR) study for design and construction services.

A link to the minutes of the [April 21, 2009 Corporate Services and Economic Development Committee meeting](#) along with the [PDF \[ 396 KB \]presentation is](#) provided.

The results of this review concluded that the use of internal and external resources were competitive depending on the type of project, complexity and implementation timelines.

## Question

In 2009 the City spent about \$247 million on outsourced legal and consulting services. In our opinion, a two-year budget freeze or 10 per cent reduction in outsourcing will have limited or no impact on service. We are questioning the rationale for \$5.7 million in legal fees and \$3.9 million dollars in consulting services. Do the skills for services below exist within the City? Please review each item, if you had used City staff to do the work, what would be the opportunity cost?

---

## City Response

Many of the items listed by OTAG as "consultants" are for the purchase of goods, engineering services, training services or other specialized services that the City does not have within its own staff complement or that are required in order to address workload issues. The list as provided by OTAG which totals \$3,919,236 has been reproduced as Document 1. Each item has been identified by staff under the following six classifications:

5. Communication services (\$323,214)
6. Goods procurement (\$515,807)
7. Operational services (\$1,681,989)
8. Project engineering services (\$990,051)
9. Recruitment services (\$45,790)
10. Training services (\$362,385)

### Document 1

Consulting Services		Value	Staff Comment
1	Supply and delivery of household starter kits for eligible clients of the Social Services Centres for two (2) years.	336,000	Goods procurement
2	Professional services to undertake project planning of the Enterprise Asset Management for the Integrated Infrastructure Management System Project (EAM-IIMS).	315,623	Operational services
3	Professional engineering services for Contract Administration for the Portobello Boulevard Widening Project.	255,946	Project engineering services
4	Project Management and Change Management Consulting including for the City's new Crisis Incident Management System (CIMS) at the Office of Emergency Management.	248,640	Operational services
5	Consulting services to undertake project management services for the Carlsbad Springs Recreation Centre.	167,464	Project engineering services
6	Professional services for various Employee Development Workshops in 2010.	156,745	Operational services
7	To perform comprehensive inspection services on the eighty (80) newly ordered diesel electric hybrid buses.	108,320	Operational services
8	Professional services for Phase II of the Economic Strategy Refresh Project.	102,522	Operational services
9	Professional services to conduct a Transportation Trend Study for the National Capital Region.	96,272	Operational services
10	Consulting services to conduct an assessment of the current Performance Management practices at the City of Ottawa, develop a Performance Management framework for consideration in supporting planning and performance monitoring processes, and develop an implementation roadmap.	95,238	Operational services
11	Professional services for Evaluation of the Supports in the Social Housing Initiative.	92,252	Operational services
12	Professional services for the Implementation Report for Phase 2 of the Lansdowne Park Partnership Plan.	79,000	Project engineering services
13	Professional project management services for various Water and Wastewater Services projects.	75,600	Project engineering services
14	Professional services for facility planning and design services for the Alta Vista Library, 2516 Alta Vista Drive.	74,218	Project engineering services
15	Professional services for the production of an Exhibit Design Plan for the Primary Exhibit of the Billings Estate National Historic Site (BENHS).	69,290	Project engineering services

16	Professional engineering services to undertake a detailed evaluation of permanently reducing King Edward Avenue from six lanes to four lanes between Rideau Street and Sussex Drive.	68,506	Project engineering services
17	Professional services for Media Monitoring (Print Media and Broadcast) for the City of Ottawa.	68,500	Operational services
18	Professional project management services for the Lead Pipe Replacement Program.	59,752	Project engineering services
19	Professional Fairness Commissioner services for the Rail Implementation Office.	50,000	Operational services
20	Professional Services for the Valuation of Post Employment Benefits.	48,000	Operational services
21	Consulting services to design and facilitate the City of Ottawa's Corporate Service Excellence Framework with the Senior Management Committee.	47,600	Communication services
22	Professional services to undertake the Disney Approach to Service Excellence One Day Workshop.	46,200	Training services
23	Supply of Sweatshirts, Mock Turtlenecks, T-Shirts and Boot Liners for Fire Fighters.	45,000	Goods procurement
24	Supply of Leather Gloves for uniformed employees.	45,000	Goods procurement
25	Professional engineering services for the Implement Public Consultation Plan, Ottawa River Resource Protection and Management.	43,766	Communication services
26	Professional services for Commodity and Tax Services.	40,000	Operational services
27	Implementation of an extranet online communities collaboration solution to support the Community Development Framework.	37,500	Communication services
28	Professional services for the Ottawa light rail transit plan.	35,970	Operational services
29	Professional services for the delivery of an estimated six (6) leadership workshops in support of management development for City of Ottawa supervisors and to develop a series of facilitator guides.	33,550	Training services
30	Professional services to undertake project planning of the Enterprise Asset Management for the Integrated Infrastructure Management System Project (EAM-IIMS).	32,762	Operational services
31	Professional services to undertake a safety, security and accessibility assessment of the City of Ottawa's surface and garage parking lots.	32,050	Operational services
32	Professional services for the English and French Project Management Training Workshops.	31,200	Training services
33	Purchase of alert and notification software for deployment within the Finance Department.	30,478	Goods procurement
34	Professional services to undertake the design of customer services training material.	30,184	Training services
35	Supply of Nylon Gym Shorts and Baseball Caps for Fire Fighters.	30,000	Goods procurement
36	Professional services to undertake twenty-five (25) days of computer training for City of Ottawa staff.	29,700	Training services
37	Consulting services for the Transit 2009 Summer Campaign.	28,845	Communication services
38	Consulting services for the Executive Search of the General Manager, Parks, Recreation and Culture Services.	27,000	Recruitment services
39	Professional services for the delivery of Career Development Workshops.	25,200	Training services
40	Professional services for return to work and ergonomics services for 2009.	25,000	Operational services
41	Professional services for a Business Plan for Transit Services.	24,965	Operational services
42	Professional services for the delivery of Conflict Resolution Workshops.	24,170	Training services
43	Professional services to provide the City of Ottawa with an Accreditation of Operating Authorities for Municipal Drinking Water Systems.	24,000	Operational services

44	Professional services for the Growing Leaders for Services Excellence Program on an as and when requested basis.	23,826	Training services
45	Consulting services for the 2009 Exhibition 'All Aboard a Century of Rail Transport' in Ottawa.	23,760	Operational services
46	Professional services to provide hosting and catering services for the Disney Workshop for the City of Ottawa Management Forum Conference.	23,675	Training services
47	Consulting services for the Services Excellence communications.	23,255	Communication services
48	Professional services to assist with the Tangible Capital Asset Reporting project.	23,000	Operational services
49	Professional engineering services of scope changes for the South Merivale Business Park Community Transportation Study.	21,148	Project engineering services
50	Professional services for the delivery of thirty-seven (37) Employee Development Workshops.	20,000	Training services
51	Professional services for the Public Outreach Green Bin Program.	19,750	Communication services
52	Professional services to undertake the development and delivery of courses pertaining to the Special Constables Training Program for five (5) Transit Law Enforcement Officers.	19,750	Training services
53	Consulting services for the Executive Search for Manager, Economic Development.	18,790	Recruitment services
54	Professional services for the Immigration Website review and update.	18,696	Communication services
55	Professional commissioning services for the CentrepoinTE Theatre expansion.	18,000	Project engineering services
56	Professional communications managements services for the Rail Implementation Office.	17,460	Communication services
57	Professional services to undertake operational analysis for a single and double roundabout on Prince of Wales Drive.	17,280	Project engineering services
58	Professional services to conduct a survey for the 2009 311 Contact Centre Customer Satisfaction Survey.	17,270	Communication services
59	Consulting services to design and deliver engagement strategies to aid the City of Ottawa in assessing the options for engaging employees with the results of the organizational-wide employee survey.	17,100	Communication services
60	Professional services to undertake the Para Transpo customers and ridership Eligibility Policy Review.	16,950	Operational services
61	Professional project management services for the Splash Wave Pool extension.	16,878	Project engineering services
62	Professional services for the residential water use survey.	16,390	Communication services
63	Professional engineering services for design and contract document preparation for the replacement of four culverts; Second Line Road (SN 648150), John Shaw Road (SN 430200), Prince of Wales (SN 118800) and Merivale Road (SN 118690).	16,246	Project engineering services
64	Supply of Cotton Gym Shorts, Gear Bags and Gym Bags for Fire Fighters.	16,000	Goods procurement
65	Professional Consulting Services for a two (2) day Strategic Planning Workshop for the Public Works Department.	16,000	Training services
66	Professional services for the Ottawa light rail public opinion research, (Fall 2009).	15,420	Communication services
67	Professional project management services for the rehabilitation of various transitway facilities.	15,312	Project engineering services
68	Professional services for the delivery of Career Development Workshops and Services.	15,300	Training services
69	One (1) year maintenance renewal for organizational charting software.	13,329	Goods procurement
70	Professional commissioning services for the Greenboro Community Centre Expansion.	12,450	Project engineering services

71	Professional commissioning services for the Overbrook Community Centre Expansion.	12,450	Project engineering services
72	Professional services to provide job specific approved training to remain in compliance with Ontario Regulations and Drinking Water Quality Management System Operator Competencies.	11,818	Training services
73	Professional services to provide executive strategic planning for the Transit Services Management Team.	11,812	Training services
74	Professional services to undertake a research project in support of the 2010 Temporary Exhibit at the Cumberland Heritage Village Museum.	10,920	Operational services
75	Project Management Services at the Ray Friel Complex.	10,511	Project engineering services
76	Professional services for the 311 Modular Mystery Caller Program.	10,500	Operational services
77	Professional services for the spring and summer 2010 recreation guide design and layout.	10,162	Communication services
78	Professional services to develop and implement surveys of employees to recommend measures to encourage the use of sustainable modes of transportation.	10,000	Communication services
	<b>Total list per OTAG Website</b>	<b>3,919,236</b>	

## City Response

A comprehensive City Response has been provided by Legal services.

Looking first at the City's authority in litigation matters, this is derived from the Delegation of Authority By-law, being By-law 2009-231, which sets out the City Clerk and Solicitor's powers in such cases. In this regard, the broad authority of the City Clerk and Solicitor is as set out below:

*27. The City Clerk and Solicitor shall be responsible for the conduct of all litigation before courts and administrative tribunals, subject to such instruction as may be issued by Council or the Corporate Services and Economic Development Committee from time to time and in the conduct of such litigation, the City Solicitor shall use the most efficient combination of staff and external legal services as required to represent and defend the interests of the City in the issue at hand.*

This delegated authority reflects the original design of the City's Legal Services Branch, as contemplated in the Ottawa Transition Board's November 14, 2000, Detailed Design Report on Legal Services. That Report envisaged a Legal Services Branch built around the following mandate:

*The goal of the Legal Services Branch is to provide timely, accurate and useful legal advice and services in the most efficient and cost-effective manner based on a "public-private partnership model", utilizing in-house and external legal resources.*

Since amalgamation, this model has been refined to provide for the majority of typical legal services to be supplied by internal counsel, with matters of greater complexity (or those which might otherwise overextend the City's limited internal resources) or which are outside the expertise of in-house counsel, being referred to external lawyers. More recently, external counsel have been retained by means of a Strategic Standing Offer, which has had the effect of reducing the hourly cost of external counsel by nearly 20 per cent.

As for the analysis which is undertaken by the City in deciding whether to pursue litigation, I would note that the overwhelming majority of disputes involve the City as defendant, responding to claims brought against it by outside parties. For example, I note that the Legal Department (since November 2008 titled the City Clerk and Solicitor Department) has responded to more than 400 lawsuits since the beginning of 2006, but has commenced fewer

---

than 10 in that same time, most of these latter cases being for the recovery of debts owing to the City. While the City Clerk and Solicitor Department defends all actions brought against the City, only a small proportion of them result in trials, with the vast majority being resolved by mutually-agreeable settlements. The Department's preference for pursuing settlement of litigation is well-explained in the following excerpt from its March 23, 2009 *Labour Relations Audit - Litigation Record* Report to the Corporate Services and Economic Development Committee:

[http://ottawa.ca/calendar/ottawa/citycouncil/csedc/2009/03-23/04 - ACS2009-CMR-LEG-0008 - Win Loss Report \(Mar 2009\).htm](http://ottawa.ca/calendar/ottawa/citycouncil/csedc/2009/03-23/04 - ACS2009-CMR-LEG-0008 - Win Loss Report (Mar 2009).htm)

*A settlement contemplates that the litigation will be formally dismissed and a full and final release (typically with a confidentiality provision) will be executed. Unlike a settlement, litigation via the courts is a public process and, as a result, negative publicity/attention can result from the litigation/trial process. An unfavourable court decision, a costs award, or even a judicial comment (even as an aside) can result in unpredictable consequences and embarrassment for a litigant. It should also be remembered that, in cases where the City is sued alongside another defendant, the statutory rules of joint and several liability mean that the City need only be found 1% liable in order to have to pay the entire cost of the judgment.*

*The classification of settlements as successful outcomes also serves to reflect the proper role of Legal Services which, reduced to its simplest notion, is to protect the City's interests and to seek just results. This is aptly outlined in the Branch's Mission Statement, which is, "[To] provide cost-effective legal services within a business-sensitive environment." Accordingly, in cases where there is little question of the City's liability at law, the City's interests are best served by avoiding costly proceedings and looking to achieve an equitable settlement. To focus on a characterization of "win" or "loss" tends to promote a dogmatic approach to litigation which, in the end, does not serve the ultimate goal of protecting the City's legal interests and limiting its financial exposure.*

In summary then, I can advise that the conduct of litigation by the City is carried out in a manner that is in keeping with the authority delegated to the City Clerk and Solicitor, and which is the subject of regular reports to the Corporate Services and Economic Development Committee and City Council. The consistent aim of the City in litigated matters is to arrive at a just result that protects City Council's legal, policy and financial interests, using the most cost-effective blend of internal and external expertise.

### **Follow Up Question Consulting & Legal Services**

In our opinion we compare the 12,786 figure at amalgamation to 14,550 in 2009. If the City reduced staff in 2004 and hired more staff later, that would not be a reduction. The figure below shows that the head count reduced by 1,573, this means the city has grown in staff size by about 20% since 2004.

We agree with that the use of consultants should increase, but only in conjunction with a decrease in staff size by natural attrition. Do we infer from your response that in all 78 cases, there is no one in the City with the skill sets?

For example on the issue of a cow on the roof top, your comment was: "Thus, a review to permit one roof-top sign requires reconsideration of the City's approach to regulating this type of sign, and requires staff to consider or identify all associated issues and impact of an amendment. In reviewing 2010 workload, priorities and staffing availability (essentially one policy officer), the conclusion reached was that in order to comply with Council direction to report back by year end, the services of a consultant..."

---

---

We infer from this comment that you have staff with the required skill, but due to "2010 workload, priorities" a consultant was engaged, our question is: list the contracts and amounts which was due to "2010 workload priority" and not a lack of skills within the organization. If the person with the skill was pulled off to do the work, please explain which jobs would have suffer?

On the issue of legal services, we are concerned about the process for actions that are initiated by the City.

We are also concerned that there are lawyers employed by the City that can handle a case, but due to "2010 workload priority" an outside law firm was hired. In all law cases handled by the City which of them does the City have the skill sets to handle in house? Why would the City engage outside Counsel for small claims court issues that have a very low liability cap?

### **Compensation (Salary, Overtime, Benefits)**

The CFIB Municipal Wage Analysis of 2006 Census on pay disparity between city staff and the private sector shows that Ottawa had the worst record: Ottawa 15.3%, Toronto 11.6%, Kitchener 10.6%, Oshawa 10.4%, London 7.6%, Hamilton 6.8%, Barrie 6.2%, Windsor 1.7% The provincial government recently announced a wage freeze for non union staff, they also said this would be the negotiation objective for union contracts. If the City followed the same wage freeze strategy, how much would it save with non union staff? How much would it save with union staff?

It was recently reported that the number of Canadians with registered pension plans have dropped from 45% to 38%. It has also been reported that the gap between the private and public sector (pension inclusive) is 35.6%.

What is the average yearly spend per person for retiree benefits in 2001 and 2009? is it \$60,000 per person in 2009?

What is the average total life time payout per person for retiree benefits in 2001 and 2009? is it \$1 million per person?

Since amalgamation were there any changes in the retirement age for receiving a pension?

If the City was required to fully fund its pension obligations each year, what would be 2010 tax increase?

If we do not tax to fund pensions now, what is the plan to pay for it?

Do staff have multiple pensions?

Do part-time workers participate in the pension system?

There was a strike in Toronto about the way pensions are calculated, what changes can be made on how pensions are calculated and please quantify the savings attributed to each change?

With reference to the growth of benefits from 2002 to 2008 and property tax affordability, Why benefits are growing faster than salaries?

Were there any changes to vacation pay?

Do all active workers and future retirees pay the health tax?

Are there any new benefits?

Do employees get paid for unused sick leave?

Can Council cap sick leave payouts?

---

Since salary and wages are growing faster than revenue and number of households, how is the shortfall being funded?

1. Total Salary Wages up 54% to \$940 million
2. Employment benefits are up 83% to \$193.8 million
3. Accumulated sick leave is up 72% to \$92 million
4. User fees are up 30% to \$583 million
5. Property taxes are up 29% to \$1,068,869,387
6. Grants from the Federal and Ontario governments are up 27% to \$391 million
7. number of taxpaying households, up 17% to 365,770

<http://cscconramp.mah.gov.on.ca/fir/ViewFIR2009.htm>

The following departments are the top earners in the City.

Please provide the top 10 job classifications by total dollar value in each department?

If these top 10 job classifications were had a 10% reduction in pay, how much savings would that generate?

We are not suggesting that you can roll back wages of current employees, but we are suggesting that changing the job classification when people retire or leave the City will be an effective way of reducing the costs.

<b>Department</b>	<b>employees</b>	<b>Wages, Benefits</b>	<b>Overtime</b>	<b>Avg Per Person</b>
General Manager Social Services	2.00	269,000		<b>134,500</b>
Deputy Manager, Community & Protective Services	2.00	261,000		<b>130,500</b>
Deputy Manager Operations	7.00	858,000		<b>122,571</b>
Auditor General	8.00	929,000		<b>116,125</b>
Ottawa Fire Services	983.00	109,589,000	1,623,000	<b>113,135</b>
Deputy Manager Operating Resource	10.49	1,110,000	5,000	<b>106,292</b>
Ottawa Police Service	1,949.30	199,516,000	5,598,000	<b>105,224</b>
City Manager	20.00	1,997,000	11,000	<b>100,400</b>
Planning Branch (Construction, Rural)	20.00	1,923,000	21,000	<b>97,200</b>
Economic & Environmental Sustainability	6.00	572,000	7,000	<b>96,500</b>
Ottawa Paramedic Services	552.45	51,086,000	1,890,000	<b>95,893</b>
Real Property Asset Management	42.50	3,995,000	35,000	<b>94,824</b>
Employee Services	127.00	11,659,000	4,000	<b>91,835</b>
Deputy Manager Public Works	19.16	1,725,000	10,000	<b>90,553</b>
Planning & Growth Management	210.40	18,865,000	177,000	<b>90,504</b>
Housing	63.40	5,664,000	60,000	<b>90,284</b>
Organizational Development & Performance	46.00	4,145,000	6,000	<b>90,239</b>
Transportation Planning	34.00	3,030,000	9,000	<b>89,382</b>
IT Services	341.00	29,690,000	423,000	<b>88,308</b>
City Clerk & Legal	197.84	16,689,000	463,000	<b>86,696</b>
Employment & Financial Assistance	556.00	48,029,000		<b>86,383</b>
Environmental Sustainability	25.00	2,129,000	13,000	<b>85,680</b>
Infrastructure Services	294.17	24,155,000	482,000	<b>83,751</b>
Fleet Services	145.00	11,414,000	499,000	<b>82,159</b>
Building Code Services	174.65	13,899,000	325,000	<b>81,443</b>
Public Health	475.70	38,369,000	265,000	<b>81,215</b>
By-Law & Regulatory Services	164.57	12,949,000	256,000	<b>80,239</b>

Council could virtually eliminate overtime by ensuring that at least 20% of all staff are part time and 10% of staff could be on call part timers (perfect for retirees). If we implemented this idea, can you confirm that it will reduce overtime by over 90% or 30 million dollars?

Can you confirm that each department can implement a target of 1% of staff as volunteers and that will save 10 million dollars and reduce overtime?

<b>Service</b>	<b>Overtime</b>
Transit Services	12,172
Ottawa Police Service	5,598
Surface Operations - Integrated Road & Water	4,728
Ottawa Paramedic Services	1,890
Ottawa Fire Services	1,623
Drinking Services	1,440
Parks & Sports Buildings & Grounds	1,176
Fleet Services	499
Infrastructure Services	482
Waste Water Services	482
City Clerk & Legal	463
IT Services	423
Building Code Services	325
Public Health	265
By-Law & Regulatory Services	256
Financial Services	234
Solid Waste	193
Engineering & Technical Services	192
Planning & Growth Management	177
Parks Recreation Services	140
Forestry Services (Public Works)	101
Long Term Care	75
Communications & Customer Service	67
Housing	60
Traffic & Parking Operations	55
Ottawa Public Library	50
Real Property Asset Management	35
Office of Emergency Management / Integrated Public Safety	24
Planning Branch (Construction, Rural)	21
Environmental Sustainability	13
City Manager	11
Deputy Manager Public Works	10
Committee of Adjustment	10
Transportation Planning	9
Economic & Environmental Sustainability	7
Organizational Development & Performance	6
Deputy Manager Operating Resource	5
Employee Services	4

---

## **City Response**

The CFIB analysis regarding Local Public Administration (p10) lists the occupations used for the purposes of comparison. When reviewing this list these occupations with the exception of Planners are primarily manual labourers or clerical/administrative support and would be unionized at the City of Ottawa. If the comparison included a greater proportion of managerial and professional employees, we would likely see the differential diminish from what has been reported.

## **City Response**

On March 25, 2010, the Ontario Government tabled Bill 16, Creating the Foundation for Jobs and Growth Act, 2010. Schedule 25 of the Bill enacts the Public Sector Compensation Restraint to Protect Public Services Act, 2010. This Act freezes the compensation structures of non-bargaining and Legislative Assembly staff, as well as non-bargaining employees in the broader public sector for a period of two years between March 24, 2010 and March 31, 2012. It is important to note that this Act does not apply to Municipalities.

The 2011 projected "cost avoidance" for non-union employees was \$1,726,511. This value was based upon the assumption of a 2.5% increase for Management and Professional Exempt staff and a 2.75% increase for Supervisory and Administrative Support employees. This value increases to \$1,878,028 when Elected Officials and Councillors Assistants are included.

Cost avoidance/savings for unionized staff was not calculated since all of bargaining units with the exception of two (ATU 279, CUPE Local 5500) have agreements in place for 2010 and 2011.

## **City Response**

As a member of the OMERS multi-employer pension plan, The City must adhere to the legislation associated with the Plan. Even though mandatory retirement was lifted in Ontario, the pension plan continues to provide for a Normal Retirement Age at 65 or 60 (Firefighters and Police) with an earliest retirement age of 55 or 50 (Firefighters and Police) with a minimum of pensionable years of service.

## **City Response**

All full time staff are required to enrol in the Ontario Municipal Employee Retirement System as part of their terms of employment. Employees contribute to the pension plan and their contributions are matched by the Employer as per OMERS Plan funding rules. These contributions are funded from taxes or rates.

Transit Services employees have access to the former OC Transpo pension plan that was closed December 31, 1998 as well as the OMERS pension plan commencing January 1, 1999.

Part time employees are eligible to be enrolled in OMERS provided that they satisfy the criterion of working at least 700 hours or earning at least 35% of the Year's Maximum Pensionable Earnings (YMPE) in each of the two immediately preceding calendar years.

## **City Response**

The City participates in the OMERS Pension Plan, which is governed in accordance to the rules and regulations as defined by the Ontario Municipal Employees Retirement Systems Act, 2006.

---

---

## City Response

Statutory benefits such as CPP and EI are based on salaries therefore increases are proportional. The insured benefits are negotiated through the collective bargaining process and cost increases are reflected on utilization and inflation factors.

## City Response

There were changes to the vacation plateaus through the collective bargaining process, but the upper and lower limits have remained unchanged. The City pays the health tax for employees within ATU Local 279 as per Collective Agreement provisions. There are no new insured benefits.

Employees who had an existing sick leave bank from an amalgamating municipality at the time of amalgamation (01 Jan 2001) had the number of days in the banks frozen (no further accruals), and the value of the frozen sick leave bank was also capped. The sick leave banks are part of former collective agreements/terms and conditions of employment. Frozen sick leave is capped at 130 days as legislated by the Municipal Act.

The "new" City of Ottawa replaced sick leave banks with a short-term disability plan that provides benefits when employees require them, but does not accrue sick days for employees that must be paid out at a later date.

## City Response:

The annual estimated costs of all programs and services provided by the City to its residents are submitted to Committee and Council for review and approval through the budget process. Through this review process Council establishes the level of service that will be provided along with the funding resources through a combination of user fees and property taxes.

## City Response

The value of jobs at the City of Ottawa is established by using the appropriate Job Evaluation Plan to assign a rating based upon duties and responsibilities in the areas of Skill, Effort, Responsibility and Working Conditions. This systematic approach to establishing the value for a job is necessary under the Pay Equity Act that the City of Ottawa is subject to. As an employer, the City cannot arbitrarily reduce the value of a job, without risking penalties associated with non-compliance under the Pay Equity Act.

The City of Ottawa has a rate of unionization of approximately 94 per cent. As a result, many of the jobs in the identified departments are unionized and represented by a bargaining unit. Any attempt to arbitrarily reduce the value of a unionized job would be challenged by the union.

For information purposes, we have provided the following link to the 2009 Public Sector Salary Disclosure list on the Provincial website.

<http://www.fin.gov.on.ca/en/publications/salarydisclosure/2009/munic09.pdf>

## Follow Up Question: Compensation (Salary, Overtime, Benefits)

What % of staff in each department are part time and what % of staff are volunteers?

With reference to the CFIB identified gap between compensation in the City and the private sector, Ottawa had the worst record in comparison to other cities. The City's response was "these occupations with exception of Planners are primarily manual labourers or clerical / administrative support and would be unionized". Does this mean other cities have gotten better deals from unions than has Ottawa?

---

---

We asked for a dollar value on the savings if the City could freeze wages of union staff, we got no response. We heard that after the failed wage freeze vote for non union staff, many non union staff joined unions, is this true and how many? If the Province can freeze the wages of non union staff and negotiate the same with union staff, why can't City Management do the same?

Total Salary Wages up 54% to \$940 million  
Employment benefits are up 83% to \$193.8 million  
Accumulated sick leave is up 72% to \$92 million

As a result of the fact that benefits are growing much faster than salaries, we need more information to understand what is driving this difference. If salaries grew 54% and benefits grew 54%, we would not be asking so many questions.

What is the average yearly spend per person for retiree benefits in 2001 and 2009? Is it \$60,000 per person in 2009?

What is the average total life time payout per person for retiree benefits in 2001 and 2009? Is it \$1 million per person?

We understand that the normal retirement age is 65 or 60, what is the earliest retirement age at the City? If this figure changes depending on the department, please let us know the answer for each department?

If we raise the minimum retirement age by 2 years, how much money would that save the City?

What is the minimum pensionable years of service at amalgamation? What is it now? If for example if it is 30 years, does that mean you can join the City at age 18 and retire at age 48 and receive much more in that lifetime than someone who retired at 60?

If the City was required to fully fund its pension obligations each year, what would the tax increase in 2010 have been?

You have identified Transit as the only department with multiple pensions, is there an extra cost to manage multiple pensions? If they have only one pension plan, how much would that save the City?

With reference to your answer on the pensions of part time employees, does that mean that you can join the city at age 48, work 2 days a week for 2 years, retire at 50 and get a pension?

The 2009 CUPE strike in Toronto was about the ability of unionized workers to carry over and cash out 18 sick days a year. Your response indicated that the City had replaced sick leave banks with short-term disability plan. Does that mean that people are still able to bank sick leave, but it is paid in form of time off as opposed to cash? What is the yearly total cost of this program? Please include the increased cost of stand by staff and overtime that is needed to cover this alternative to banking sick days.

The City pays the health premium for staff of some departments, please list them?

You mentioned changes to the vacation plateaus after amalgamation, can you explain what this means and what these changes cost?

With reference to job classification changes, you mentioned that "Any attempt to arbitrarily reduce the value of a unionized job would be challenged by the union", would this still be the

---

---

case if it is done by natural attrition, i.e. when someone retires? In what cases can these changes be legally made?

### **Outsourcing (Transit, Housing, Parks & Recreation, Others)**

It is fair to say that that Greyhound or Laidlaw is more efficient than OC Transpo, Minto is more efficient than Ottawa Social Housing etc Further evidence of private sector benefits include the Ottawa Airport and the outsourcing of garbage collection. The downside of privatization is that the drive for profits needs to be matched by an equally strong drive for public interest regulation. For example in the UK they privatized the water supply but rate hikes are regulated, they also regulate what % of revenue should be invested back into infrastructure. The potential for outsourcing is limitless as there are even companies that have outsourced their human resource, manufacturing, IT departments etc.

City council in Windsor, Ont., took a step toward outsourcing its \$1.3-million parking enforcement service...14-employee division has been plagued by chronic absenteeism in recent years, despite a salary boost of 27 per cent between 2005 and 2008 and other measures meant to "cultivate a more positive work environment,"

<http://www.cbc.ca/canada/windsor/story/2009/12/01/windsor-parking-outsourcing-091201.html>

Representatives of about a dozen private garbage haulers turned up Saturday to a Q-and-A session with city engineers who explained the process for bidding on collecting Windsor's trash.

<http://www.windsorstar.com/Potential+garbage+collection+outsourcing+bidders+meet+with+city/3006667/story.html>

While outsourcing will provide some immediate efficiency benefits, the City also has a 15% private sector salary gap and a 35.6% gap when pensions are included; this guarantees a quantifiable benefit from outsourcing. Without privatizing the whole department, what opportunities exist for private sector involvement / public private partnership in the following departments? Kindly estimate the savings from outsourcing each of the services below? For example: CFIB 2006 Transit Wage Analysis on pay disparity between city transit staff and the private sector: Ottawa 24%, Toronto 22.7%, Vancouver 17.4%, Montreal 15%, Calgary 5%.

<http://www.cfib.ca/research/reports/rr3077.pdf>

<http://www.taxpayer.com/sites/default/files/BeggarsCheckList.pdf>

Housing (some ideas include a 3P between apartment owner, private sector property manager and the City which will reduce the cost of maintaining units)

Home Ownership Down Payment Assistance Program

Other Housing Programs (Please List Each Program & Cost)

Affordable Housing

Residential & Support Housing

External Structure Repairs

Internal Structure Repairs

Plumbing Repairs

Electrical Repairs

Heating & Cooling System

Cleaning

Waste Management

Flooring

Doors & Windows

Security

Pest Control

Outdoor & Gardening

Legal

Billing

Estimating & Costing

Fleet & Transportation

Interior Decoration

IT

Managing Applications

---

---

Transit (some ideas include hourly leasing of buses / mini vans for lower ridership routes to owner operator minded drivers)

Labour - Maintenance  
Labour – Bus Operator  
Scheduling  
LRT  
Bus Purchase  
O Train  
Para Transpo  
Security  
Rail Safety & Development  
Service Design  
Fleet  
Other Facilities Maintenance  
Uniforms

Transit Way Maintenance  
Transit Station Maintenance  
Transit Shelter Maintenance  
IT  
Telephone & Radio Equipment  
Gasoline  
Other Parts  
Engine Parts  
Body Parts  
Tires  
Brakes  
Other Lubricants

Parks & Recreation (when their budget was cut in half, how did the NCC utilize outsourcing in the management of parks?)

Parks Recreation Services  
Museums  
Billings Estate National Historic Site  
Cumberland Heritage Village  
Pinhey's Point Historic Site  
Community Museums  
Soccer Fields  
Ball Diamonds  
Arenas

Pools  
Recreation Centres  
Seniors Centres  
Community Buildings  
Arts Facilities  
Lansdowne Park  
Parks  
Pine View Municipal Golf Course

#### Parks & Sports Buildings & Grounds

Aquatics - Maintain Indoor And Outdoor Pools  
Aquatics - Swimming Instructional Programs  
Aquatics - Therapeutic And Fitness Programs  
Aquatics - Drowning Prevention And Safety  
Aquatics - Aquatic Leadership Programs  
Aquatics - Introductory/Learn To Aquatic Sports  
Aquatics - Facilitate Pool And/Or Facility Rentals

Arena- Introductory 'Learn To Skate'  
Arenas- Ice Sports Public Skating Instruction  
Arenas- Manage Arena Ice Allocations And Slab Rentals  
Arenas- Operate Indoor Skate Parks During Summer Months

Community Centres- Instructional Recreation  
Community Centres- Instructional Fitness  
Community Centres- Instructional Arts  
Community Centres- Instructional Special Interest Programs  
Community Centres- Instructional Partnerships With Community Groups  
Community Centres- Facility Bookings  
Community Centres- Indoor Programming  
Community Centres- Meeting Space For Community And Private Groups  
Community Centres- Manage Public Access To Computers

Sportsfields  
Ball Diamonds  
Parks  
Outdoor Rinks  
Wading Pools  
Beaches  
Beach Volleyball Programs And Rentals

Facilitate Community Access To Schools  
Programs For Target Populations Including Integration Services  
Specialized Programs For Persons With Disabilities

---

Promote Women And Sport Programs  
 Deliver Youth Programming & Outreach Including Youth On The Move  
 Student Employment Opportunities  
 Develop New Programs  
 Provide Emergency Shelter And Coordination  
 Promote Community Recreation Development And Volunteer Support

Maintain Community Gardens  
 Operate Park-Ticipate And Manage Allocation Of Special Events Equipment  
 Park Development And Redevelopment;  
 Deliver Recreation Facility Planning And Development  
 Promote Capital Partnership Development And Funding  
 Manage Capital Budget Development And Business Plan Development  
 Initiate Public-Private Partnerships (P3s)  
 Develop And Implementation Of Customer Service

### City Response

This statement that the City did not reduce the workforce at amalgamation has been made numerous times by a number of residents. To address this misconception, staff was directed by Council in 2004 to conduct an annual staffing analysis report which would assist senior management and Council in planning and decision-making by providing information on how human resources were being utilized and by showing human resource historic trends over time.

The following link is provided to the 2009 report which was tabled with the Audit, Budget and Finance Committee on November 17, 2009.

<http://ottawa.ca/calendar/ottawa/citycouncil/abfc/2009/11-17/10 - REVISED ACS2009-COS-HRS-0002 2009 FTE Analysis Report Nov 2 2009 English.htm>

The following table summarizes the changes in the City's FTE position over the 2000 to 2009 time period.

<b>FTE's in 2000</b>	<b>12,786</b>
Amalgamation Savings	(665)
2004 Reorganization	(908)
<b>Increases</b>	
<b><i>Mandated / Legislative Programs</i></b>	
Paramedics	547
Public Health	117
Long Term Care	38
Housing	33
All Other Programs	68
	<b>803</b>
<b><i>Council Approved Program Increases</i></b>	
Transit	1,118
Police	444
Parks & Recreation	160
By-law	117
Real Property / Facilities	109
Fire	67
Library	59
Cultural Services	52
All Other Programs	408

---

FTE's in 2009	2,534
	14,550

## City Response

The 2001 and 2010 budgets as adopted by Council included compensation of \$688.4 million and \$1.235 billion respectively an increase of 79 per cent.

The main factors contributing to the increase in compensation over this period are as follows:

- staffing increases to programs and services per the above chart in order to maintain Council approved service standards as a result of the population growth in the City;
- economic increases resulting from contract settlements;
- benefit plan increases, primarily for the reinstatement of pension plan contributions in 2003 – 2004; and

increases associated with increments for employees as they progress to the maximum pay of their position based on satisfactory performance and for the costs to harmonize salaries as a result of the amalgamation.

## City Response

Any questions that deal with policy issues will not elicit staff City Response as setting policy is Council's prerogative. (For example: questions that ask staff to prioritize services are policy questions.)

## Follow Up Question Outsourcing (Housing, Parks & Recreation, Others)

See general comments, if we had a more detailed budget we could answer our own questions.

The following quote was taken from an NCC internal document. "The NCC embarked on a major retooling of its operations with the intent of saving 25 percent of its overall budget, while maintaining the existing delivery of projects and services to the public. The strategic action plan included:

- Contracting out of land management (site and facility maintenance) and property management (leasing) functions to the greatest extent possible while retaining control over results and standards;
- Reducing the size of the organization and its administration;
- Preserving the knowledge base of employees and ensuring a smooth transition to private-sector operations by encouraging the creation of "Employee Takeover Corporations";"
- [http://www.canadascapital.gc.ca/data/2/rec\\_docs/9494\\_MandateReview\\_En.pdf](http://www.canadascapital.gc.ca/data/2/rec_docs/9494_MandateReview_En.pdf)

Has the City implemented any of these initiatives for parks & recreation?

There about 25 capital projects in Parks & Recreation, we have asked for the impact of a 10% cut on each budget?

With reference to the operating costs, we listed about 44 services and programs; and asked for the impact of a 5% cut on each service?

We also asked if the City reduced the fleet expense (\$24 million), over time (1.2 million) & new programs budget by 15% or about \$4 million, what is the impact?

---

Can the city post the all overtime request justification for each employee in this department on a website? The names should be removed; it is just hard to understand why a non emergency service has so much overtime.

**Transit**

Total spending has doubled in 9 years to 386 million, 400% increase in overtime, doubling of bus garage cost to \$100 million dollars, absenteeism, fines for not calling out stops, failure to warm buses during winter, leaving passengers stranded, empty buses due to scheduling problems, ticket machines that don't work, articulated buses that can't turn, selling buses with 6 more years of life at a 40% discount etc. Kindly estimate the cost of providing each service based on the groups below? If there is a 5% cut on this core service, what will be the impact to each cost group?

Total Transit compensation has gone up 244% since 2001 to about 218 million dollars or 58% of the total Transit budget, if past growth is replicated into the future, the cost of bus passes will double in 10 years, do you agree with this projection? If not, how will the growth be funded? How many part time bus operators did we have at amalgamation and how many do we have now? What is the reason for the change?

	Service	operating cost	Total Program
	<b>Transit Services</b>		
	Labour - Maintenance		
	Labour – Bus Operator		
	Scheduling		
	LRT		
	Bus Purchase		
	O Train		
	Para Transpo		
	Security		
	Rail Safety & Development		
	Service Design		
	Fleet		
	Other Facilities Maintenance		
	Transit Way Maintenance		
	Transit Station Maintenance		
	Transit Shelter Maintenance		
	IT		
	Telephone & Radio Equipment		
	Gasoline		
	Other Parts		
	Engine Parts		
	Body Parts		
	Tires		
	Brakes		
	Other Lubricants		
17	Uniforms	384,910	386,536

---

On the assumption that the Province and the Federal Government will provide \$600 million dollars each for our transit plan, please provide a cost estimate for the following transit options (we are not asking you to spend time to provide an accurate figure, we would be pleased with an answer that has a + or - \$200 million accuracy):

BRT with tunnel (city's contribution is less than 100 million?)  
LRT with tunnel (city's contribution is more than 900 million?)

LRT without tunnel (city's contribution is less than 300 million?)  
BRT without tunnel (city's contribution is less than 100 million?)

Heavy rail from outlying cities and BRT with tunnel (city's contribution is less than 100 million?)  
Heavy rail from outlying cities and LRT with tunnel (city's contribution is more than 900 million?)

Heavy rail from outlying cities and BRT without tunnel (city's contribution is less than 100 million?)  
Heavy rail from outlying cities and LRT without tunnel (city's contribution is more than 300 million?)

O-Train loop across the Alexandra Bridge on the empty train lane.

Use of the existing tunnel

Use of the Bryon right of way for either LRT or BRT expansion.

Aerial Gondola's in some spots downtown

The Bixie commuter bike system

<http://ottawa.ca/calendar/ottawa/citycouncil/occ/2009/11-25/tc/03-ACS2009-ICS-TRA-0017%20-%20Rail%20System%20Selection.htm>

<http://ottawa.ca/calendar/ottawa/citycouncil/occ/2010/01-13/tc/ACS2009-ICS-PGM-0214.htm>

<http://ottawa.ca/calendar/ottawa/citycouncil/occ/2010/01-13/tc/ACS2009-CCS-TTC-0021.htm>

[http://www.ottawasun.com/news/columnists/susan\\_sherring/2010/01/23/12589681.html](http://www.ottawasun.com/news/columnists/susan_sherring/2010/01/23/12589681.html)

<http://www.caw4304.ca/lrt/index.htm>

[http://www.telecabinemontreal.com/benefits\\_en.html](http://www.telecabinemontreal.com/benefits_en.html)

<http://www.ibiketo.ca/blog/2008/09/23/bixi-montreals-public-bike-system>

### City Response:

A summary of the 2001 and 2010 compensation budgets are provided below.

	2001	2010	Inc
Overtime elements	6,279,196	12,676,005	102%
Total compensation	117,282,338	225,872,234	93%

The increase is due to the expansion of service over the past 10 years as the City continues to grow and contract settlements. In addition, ParaTranspo services were provided by the private sector at the time of amalgamation but were brought in-house in 2008 due to the lack of private sector interest in providing this service when the contract expired.

---

---

### **City Response**

Any increases in the annual price of a bus pass will be decided by future Councils

### **City Response**

There are no part-time bus operators employed by OC Transpo. With the assumption of ParaTranspo services in-house, there are 16 part-time drivers.

### **City Response**

In November 2008, Council approved the City's Transportation Master Plan which calls for a greatly expanded network of bus rapid transit and electrified light rail corridors through the downtown which incorporates a tunnel. Staff will not be developing estimates for alternative scenarios as presented below. The following is a link to that report [http://www.ottawa.ca/city\\_hall/master\\_plans/tmp/index\\_en.html](http://www.ottawa.ca/city_hall/master_plans/tmp/index_en.html)

### **Follow Up Question Transit**

The figure of 400% increase in overtime was a direct quote from the OC Transpo General Manager, during the strike.

Your response says there are currently no part time operators in OC Transpo. The fir reports say that in 2002 there were 422 part time operators, since this is the best way to eliminate overtime, why don't we hire some part time bus operators?

On the issue of the Transit options it is unfortunate that the City is not willing to provide cost for the different alternatives.

On the issue of Para Transpo being brought back in house, the transit business can be broken into 4 main areas: stations & bus shelters, buses, maintenance and bus operation. It would seem that in the case of maintenance and bus operation, the private sector has a natural compensation advantage. CFIB showed a 24% transit compensation gap between the private and public sector in Ottawa, throw in pensions and the gap jumps to 40%. Compensation is about 60% of the total transit costs, so why was the private sector not interested? If the issue is low ridership, it would seem that City could subsidize lower ridership and still come out ahead.

### **Police / Fire / Paramedic**

Kindly estimate the cost of providing each service based on the groups below? If there is a 5% cut on this core services, what will be the impact to each cost group?

The Ministry of Defense has a large civilian population, we have identified 50 police services that can be done by trained civilians who do not need danger pay and would not be subject to police / fire / paramedic collective agreements. Depending on the number of civilians already doing these jobs, compensation costs for these services could be reduced by as much as 30%. Please let us know the civilian vs. police head count and total compensation cost for each of these 50 police services? Are there any legislative impediments to using civilians for these 50 services and who controls that legislation?

4 police cars went to a residence because one person killed one pig, ate and gave some to his neighbour. This at the same time when there are unsolved murders, convenience store & bank robberies, break ins, sexual assault, gang violence etc. is inappropriate. Ditto for speeches at schools, neighborhood watch meetings, reference checks, hunting mousse etc. we really need to ask ourselves hard questions like do we need danger pay individuals doing traffic duty during road construction, computer research or writing reports for insurance companies

In the case of Fire / Paramedic please use similar logic to provide answers for civilian vs. fire personnel profile for all office / non fire / non rescue / non paramedic jobs.

---

	Service	operating cost	Total Program
6	Crime Prevention		400
7	<b>Ottawa Police Service</b>  <b>Front Line Policing</b> Airport Policing Section Airport Watch Program Arson Section Canine Unit Drugs Elder Abuse Firearms Unit Gangs Homicides Missing Persons Partner Assault Diplomatic Community Robbery Sexual Assault Child Abuse Bad Date Line Special Constables Court Security Street Racing Traffic Section- Speed Traps Child Pornography Counterfeit Currency  Higher % of Office Work 1. Enforcement Of Non Commercial Incidents (Natural Resources / Conservation Authority) 2. Identity Theft & Fraud Investigation 3. Police Stations Facilities Maintenance 4. Community – Prevention & Awareness 5. Evidence Control 6. Electronic Records Control 7. Alarm Management 8. Cheques Scams 9. Lottery Scams 10. Charitable Organization Scam 11. Phishing Scam 12. Computer Fraud 13. Corporate Fraud 14. Credit Card And Debit Card Fraud 15. Fraud Against Seniors 16. Identity Theft Lost Or Stolen Wallet 17. High Tech Crime And Internet Child Exploitation 18. Social Assistance (Welfare) Fraud 19. Online Bullying 20. Spam Email & Objectionable Web Content 21. Hacking 22. Professional Standards Section	246,782	249,558

	23. Compliment 24. Complaints 25. Disciplinary Hearings And Decisions Property 26. Retail Robbery Prevention 27. Personal Robbery And Swarming Prevention Tips 28. On-Line Purchases 29. Sale Of Items 30. Court Liaison 31. Traffic Section- Collision 32. Integrated Road Safety Program 33. Bicycle Safety 34. Infant And Booster Car Seats Group 35. Motorcycle Riding Tips 36. Winter Driving Tips 37. School Bus Safety 38. New And Alternative Vehicles 39. Insurance Bureau Of Canada 40. Tickets 41. E-Warnings 42. Electronic Ticketing 43. Set Fines 44. Traffic Complaints 45. Underwater Search And Recovery Unit 46. Victim Crisis Unit 47. Victim Crisis Unit Success Break And Enter 48. 9-1-1 Communications Centre 49. Crime Related Communication- Website Media		
8	<b>Ottawa Fire Services</b>  <b>Fire Suppression</b> Structural Non-Structural Rural Fires Industrial And Special-Hazard Fires Wild land Fires Airport Fires Marine Fires Hazardous Materials Nbc Threats Carbon Monoxide Calls  <b>Prevention &amp; Public Education</b> Rescue/Ems Services Tiered Response To Medical Calls Motor Vehicle/Equipment Accidents Confined Space/High Angle Ice And Water Rescue Trench Wilderness Sar	132,744	122,995

	Urban Sar  <b>Disaster Support</b> Planning Response Shelters Eoc Information Supply Points  <b>Public Assistance</b> Water Delivery (Rural) Lock Out Heavy Lift Wires Down Controlled Burns  <b>Fire Office Jobs</b> Planning Scheduling Dispatch Investigations Victim Counseling Public Awareness Residential Inspections Commercial Inspections		
9	<b>Ottawa Paramedic Services</b>  Fires Rescues Water Rescues Industrial Accidents Hazardous Material Incidents Police Operations Public Education & Training  <b>Paramedic Office Jobs</b> Planning Scheduling Dispatch Investigations Victim Counseling Public Awareness Residential Inspections Commercial Inspections	72,504	64,991
10	Office Of Emergency Management / Integrated Public Safety	2,444	6,464

### City Response

A breakdown of the Police staffing is provided per the link to the 2010 Police Services budget document (Appendix C – Page 51). A summary of the staffing and compensation is presented in the following table.

[http://www.ottawapolice.ca/Libraries/Publications/2010\\_Draft\\_Budget\\_11.sflb.ashx](http://www.ottawapolice.ca/Libraries/Publications/2010_Draft_Budget_11.sflb.ashx)

	Staffing FTE's	Compensation Budget \$M
Sworn Officers	1,371.0	155.1
Civilians*	578.3	50.0
Total	1949.3	205.1

\* Includes term and casual positions

The attached link is to the "Strategic Deployment Plan Project - Update" report which was presented by the Police Chief to the Ottawa Police Services Board on November 23, 2009. Included in the report is an analysis of the civilian to sworn officer ratio (Section D).  
<http://ottawa.ca/calendar/ottawa/citycouncil/opsb/2009/11-23/item3att1.htm>

### Question

In the case of Fire / Paramedic please use similar logic to provide answers for civilian vs. fire personnel profile for all office / non fire / non rescue / non paramedic jobs. Are there any legislative impediments to using civilians for these 50 services and who controls that legislation?

For example: 4 police cars responded because one person killed a pig; at the same time there are unsolved murders, convenience store and bank robberies, break ins, sexual assault, gang violence etc. is this inappropriate? Ditto for speeches at schools, neighbourhood watch meetings etc. We really need to ask ourselves hard questions like do we need danger pay for individuals doing traffic duty during road construction, computer research or writing reports for insurance companies.

### City Response

The number of Fire and Paramedic positions along with non-Fire and non-Paramedic positions within the service are summarized below:

	FTE	\$M
Paramedics	557.45	51.652
Non paramedic	19.00	1.679
	576.45	53.331
Fire-OPFFA*	963.00	97.256
Volunteer	-	2.072
Non OPFFA	40.00	3.752
	1,003.00	103.080

\*Ottawa Professional Fire Fighter Association

### Follow Up Question Police / Fire / Paramedics

As a general rule of thumb, jobs that can be done at the office are an opportunity for using more non uniformed personnel, for example:

---

**Police:** enforcement of non commercial incidents (conservation authority, identity theft, prevention & awareness, evidence control, electronic records, alarm management, computer & paper fraud, welfare fraud, online bullying, spam email & objectionable web content, hacking, professional standards, compliment, complaints, retail robbery prevention, on-line purchases, court liaison, traffic section- collision, bicycle safety. infant and booster car seats group, motorcycle riding tips, winter driving tips, insurance bureau of Canada, e-warnings, electronic ticketing, underwater search and recovery unit, victim crisis unit, 911 comm. centre,

**Paramedics:** planning, scheduling, dispatch, investigations, public awareness, residential inspections, commercial inspections

**Fire:** planning, scheduling, dispatch, investigations, public awareness, residential inspections, commercial inspections.

We were not given the average compensation per person for civilian positions, nor were we given the number of civilians working in these services. However based on the limited information provided we have identified the following positions that are currently staffed by sworn police officers; Professional Standards 9 people, Corporate Support 49, Human Resources 81, and Traffic Escort 30. These positions should be at a civilian pay rate. Civilians are currently 30% of the police department, the average compensation per person for the police department is \$105,224, if the police force increased the number of civilians through natural attrition to 50% of the department head count at the City's average compensation of \$82,561, the police force will save \$11 million dollars a year without affecting services.

The average compensation per person for the fire department is \$113,135, if they increased the number of civilians through natural attrition to 50% of the department head count at the City's average compensation of \$82,561, the fire department will save \$12 million dollars a year without affecting services.

The average compensation per person for the paramedic department is \$95,893, if they increased the number of civilians through natural attrition to 50% of the department head count at the City's average compensation of \$82,561, the paramedic department will save \$3 million dollars a year without affecting services.

## **Bylaw**

Kindly estimate the cost of providing each bylaw listed below?

A Councilor said that since amalgamation, we have moved from 18,000 to 80,000 complaints. This type of growth is unsustainable. What is the growth in the by-law budget from 2001 to 2010?

We have prioritized by-laws into 47 groups, if we cut the by-law operating and capital budget by 25% or about 5 million dollars what will be the impact on service? Please focus on the lower half, as we feel that half the by-laws should not be enforced except in extreme cases. In this question we are looking for your input on creative legal solutions to reduce the by-law budget and eventually make by-law self funding.

In certain cases the complainant should pay a token amount to make a complaint, they can be refunded if the violator is fined. The person, who complained about a cow on the roof top, should have paid a token fee to make the complaint.

For example the idling by law should not be enforced unless it involves a fleet of vehicles or exceeds 1 hour.

---

For example the tree by-law should not be enforced unless more than one tree is involved or more than 5 neighbors complain. Ditto for pesticide, signs on private property etc.

For example if a large land lord fails to provide heat or their building often has false alarms, they should pay for the associated costs, else there should be human verification before resources are deployed.

	Service	operating cost	Total Program
32	<b>By-Law &amp; Regulatory Services</b> 1. By-Lawbuilding 2. By-Lawcare Of Streets 3. By-Lawsnow And Ice 4. By-Lawroad Cuts 5. By-Law On Street Parking 6. By-Lawdischarge Of Firearms 7. By-Lawburn Permits 8. By-Lawnoise 9. By-Lawparks 10. By-Lawtaxis 11. By-Lawjunk/Debris 12. By-Lawprivate Roadways 13. By-Lawdriveways 14. By-Lawoff Street Parking 15. By-Lawencroachments 16. By-Lawinadequate Yard Maintenance 17. By-Lawminimum Temperature (Rental Units) 18. By-Lawbusiness Licensing 19. By-Lawbusiness Licensing - Personal Service Establishments 20. By-Lawbusiness Licensing - Restaurant 21. By-Lawbilingualism 22. By-Lawcats 23. By-Lawdogs 24. By-Lawanimal Care And Control 25. By-Lawsmoking - Public Place 26. By-Lawsmoking - Workplace 27. By-Lawtop Soil Preservation 28. By-Lawpublic Meetings 29. By-Lawjunk Mail 30. By-Lawvoluntary Admail Reduction Program 31. By-Lawtree Protection 32. By-Lawapartments In Houses 33. By-Lawpool Enclosures 34. By-Lawfence Height 35. By-Lawfences 36. By-Lawoutdoor Fireplaces 37. By-Lawfireworks 38. By-Lawvehicles - Oversize 39. By-Lawportable And Temporary Signs 40. By-Lawtemporary Signs On Private Property 41. By-Lawposting On Poster Collars 42. By-Lawstorage 43. By-Lawweeds 44. By-Lawidling Control 45. By-Law Garbage Inspectors 46. Directional Farm Signage Program	18,740	17,965

---

## City Response

The following table shows the expenditure and revenue budgets for By-law Services from 2001 to 2010.

Budget	Expenditures \$000	Revenues \$000	Net Surplus \$000
2001	9,610	(16,958)	(7,348)
2002	9,875	(15,827)	(5,952)
2003	11,280	(18,083)	(6,803)
2004	11,290	(18,287)	(6,997)
2005	12,875	(18,437)	(5,562)
2006	13,985	(18,793)	(4,808)
2007	15,067	(20,533)	(5,466)
2008	17,069	(22,010)	(4,941)
2009	16,708	(23,315)	(6,607)
2010	17,458	(23,290)	(5,832)

## City Response

Any questions that deal with policy issues will not elicit staff City Response as setting policy is Council's prerogative. (For example: questions that ask staff to prioritize services are policy questions.)

## City Response

As can be seen from the above table, revenues exceed the costs associated with By-law Services.

## City Response

Any questions that deal with policy issues will not elicit staff City Response as setting policy is Council's prerogative. (For example: questions that ask staff to prioritize services are policy questions.)

## Follow Up Question Bylaw

We absolutely need the cost of enforcing each of the 47 bylaws. The response that revenue is greater than the cost is insufficient as this likely means 20% of the bylaws are generating 80% of the revenue. It also means 20% of the bylaws are generating 80% of the costs. If we knew the cost of enforcing each bylaw, we could have a more informed debate about which by laws are not enforced except in extreme cases.

## Libraries

Kindly estimate the cost of providing each service based on the groups below? If there is a 10% cut on this non core service, what will be the impact to each cost group?

In addition to finding out the impact of a 10% cut in the budget by listing the cost groups; we would like a list of all services provided that are not in the Library Services Act, cost and what user fee will make those services self funded based on the current number of users e.g. video games, movies etc.

With reference to the new library, if the fund for buying the land and building the library comes from the existing library budget, which branches can be sold to pay for the new central library? This would be branches that are close to other branches.

---

	Service	operating cost	Total Program
23	<b>Ottawa Public Library</b> Library Board Support Access And Outreach Services Virtual Library Services: Collections Services Information And Reader Services Borrower Services Facility Booking Branch Maintenance Branch Furniture Public Computers Bookmobil Cataloguing Educational Videos Books Online Records Movies Dvds Video Games	40,366	38,981

### City Response

This is in response to your queries on the Ottawa Public Library Budget

The Ottawa Public Library is a core city service provided under the authority of the Ontario Public Libraries Act. According to the latest citizen satisfaction survey conducted by the City of Ottawa in 2009, the Ottawa Public Library has one of the highest if not the highest citizen satisfaction rate @ 91%. More than five million users passed through the doors of our facilities in 2009 and more than 6.3 million used the library electronically. The Library is the most heavily used civic facility in Ottawa.

The OPL-BPO as per the Public Libraries Act (RSO 1009, Chapter P.44) and accompanying Regulation 976, as well as Board policy cannot and does not charge for lending materials no matter what the format. To charge for loaning these materials would be a violation of the Provincial Library Legislation and would make the OPL-BPO ineligible for the provincial operating grant (\$1.4M annually) and other library funding programs provided by the provincial government. It would also add to administrative operating costs.

The Library in conjunction with the Friends of the Ottawa Public Library Association and the Ottawa Public Library Foundation has a strong program of external fundraising. Each year the amount of money raised increases. It is used to purchase resources, materials and programs that cannot be supported by the Library's regular budget. This reduces the burden on the local taxpayer. In 2009, the amount raised was \$750,000. This excludes the long term trust funds that the OPL Foundation is developing. This also excludes the \$4.725M from the tri-government Infrastructure Stimulus Funding Program which is being used to rehabilitate five community branch facilities. The improvement of the OPL's Places and Spaces is one of the five pillars of the Library Board's Strategic Directions and Priorities 2008-2011. The Board is working to expand this branch improvement program in the next budget cycle.

---

With regard to community and district library branches, both Council and the Library Board have declared publicly that they will not be closing any branches. This would also apply to the building of a new central library. The Ottawa Public Library system has one of the smallest footprints (0.48 sf/capita) for any large urban library in Canada.

The Ottawa Public Library and the City of Ottawa are full participants in OMBI, the Ontario Municipal Benchmarking Initiative. This includes Ontario municipalities serving 74% of Ontario's population.

Some of the most important statistics include:

Item	Total	Per capita
Library uses	26.5 M	28.1
Circulation (highest of all OMBI libraries)	10.6M	11.6
Library holdings (below OMBI mean and median)	2.23 M	2.5
\$\$ Library cost per capita (2nd lowest of all OMBI libraries)		\$45.66
\$\$ Library cost per use (2nd lowest of all OMBI libraries)		\$1.63
Square Feet Per Capita (lowest of all OMBI libraries)		0.09 SF

### Follow Up General Question

What we really need is a detailed city budget. **The 2010 Comp Non Comp file has a good format but lacks lower level detail** which would be separate item categories in SAP, so it must be possible to get us a lower level report for each cost centre.

For example if we wanted to know what the police spends on printing or office furniture, or what libraries spend on video games, we have no clue. In each department we **listed the costs we are looking for, that would give you an idea of the level of detail we want**. At the moment 20% of our questions are addressed, if we can get detailed costs our satisfaction level will jump to 80%. We will then not be asking staff the impact of a 10% cut in a specific department, as we will have the information to answer that question.

### Downloaded & Non Mandated Services (Public Health, Employment & Financial Assistance, Housing, Long Term & Child Care)

Kindly estimate the cost of providing each service based on the groups below? If there is a 5% cut on this core service, what will be the impact to each cost group? For example Youth Services Bureau would be too high a level, we need these services and costs broken down to project and program level.

With reference to downloading and uploading, please list all non mandated services that are provided by Ottawa Public Health, Employment & Financial Assistance and Housing, Long Term & Child Care and any other down loaded services? We have heard that there is about \$30 million in non mandated services within these departments. Please respond with costs for each non mandated program or project, this will facilitate an educated opinion about how to prioritize them.

---

	Service	operating cost	Total Program
5	<p><b>Public Health Mandated Programs Include:</b> Blood-Borne Infection Prevention, Child Health Promotion, Chronic Disease Prevention  Food Safety, Health Hazard Prevention And Management  Infectious Disease Prevention And Control, Injury Prevention, Population Health Assessment, Public Health Emergency Preparedness, Rabies Prevention And Control, Reproductive Health Promotion, Research And Program Evaluation, Safe Water, Sexual Health Promotion, Sexually Transmitted Infection Prevention, Substance Misuse Prevention, Surveillance, Tuberculosis Prevention And Control</p> <p><b>Health Promotion</b>  Giving Our Children A Healthy Start  Breastfeeding Challenge  Prenatal Health.  Healthy Baby Healthy Children Nurses  Youth Leading Youth To Say No To Tobacco- All-Night Movie Screening, Student Film Festival  Our Francophone Community  Increasing Healthy Food Options In Schools  Healthyottawa@Work  Promoting Cancer Prevention  Well Baby Drop In Clinics  Summer Parks Program  The Injury Prevention Program  Party Smart Forum  Integrated Road Safety Program  Heat &amp; Frostbite Alerts  Ottawa Drowning Prevention  Be A Germ Stopper: Hand  Emergency Preparedness  Postpartum Depression Peer Support,  Bike Helmet Safety  Winter Active &amp; Winter Smart  Friendly Corner Fitness Leaders.  Food Handler Training  Multilingual Phone Line  Pathway Control And Gottawalk  Why Drive High?  Led A Diabetes Prevention  Workplace Walking Challenges  Driven To Quit Challenge.  Cycling And Skating Helmet Fitting Education  Francophone Component Gardecontrôle.Ca Campaign</p> <p><b>Health Protection</b>  The Infectious Disease Prevention And Control Division  Health Hazard Investigation  Healthy Sexuality  Operation Hairspray  Influenza Pandemic Preparedness  Smoke-Free Ontario  Preventing Injuries  Sabrina's Law  Kashechewan  Immunization  Preventing The Spread Of Tuberculosis  Dental Health  Food Safety  Community Food Advisors  Eatsafe Ottawa - Pilot Site  Needle Retrieval Program  Biting Back At Bed Bugs  Monitoring Water At Beaches  Communicable Disease And Outbreak Management  Inactive Tuberculosis Program.  Seniors Care  Stand Up! Program  Home Support Exercise Program  Isolated Seniors Program (Rotis),  Flu Clinics</p> <p><b>Health Surveillance</b>  Restaurant Inspections  Store Inspections</p>	49,825	48,209

	Beach Inspections Public Health Inspections Of Personal Service Establishments (Body Modification, Spa Services, Beauty Parlour, Hair Salons, Barbers, Tanning, Massage) The Ward Health Profiles The Infant Care Survey The Rapid Risk Factor Surveillance System (Rfss) The Body Mass Index (Bmi) Ischaemic Heart Disease (Ihd) Ontario West Nile Virus Benchmarking Project Vaccine-Preventable Disease Prevention And Surveillance The Rural Health Program Rural Well Water Testing (Cpr) Training At Agricultural Fall Fairs.		
18	<b>Employment &amp; Financial Assistance</b>  Youth Services Bureau Emergency Assistance Fire Flood Impending Eviction Health-Related Crisis Family Violence Death In The Immediate Family Theft Resources For The Sole Support Parent Emergency Assistance Prescription Drugs Dental And Eyeglasses Subsidies Family Support Program Child Care In Ottawa Programs For Children With Special Needs Foster Care Success By 6 Ontario Drug Benefit Program Trillium Drug Program City Dental Clinics Eyeglasses Family Support Program. Negotiate Out-Of-Court Support Agreements. Undertake Investigations To Locate Parents	216,749	234,454
20	<b>Long Term Care</b>  Nursing & Personal Care Meal Services Outreach Programs Provide Environmental Services Laundry Housekeeping Dietary Administration Programs	49,350	49,152
21	<b>Childcare</b>  Licensed Care E.G Home Child Care Group Child Care Programs For Special Needs Children Other Municipal Child Care Programs Service Child Care Agencies Before And After School Recreation Programs Summer Camps Subsidy Eligibility Assessment Child Care Capital Funding Early Learning Best Start Initiatives Subsidized Child Care Services	95,349	95,315
22	<b>Housing</b>  Home Ownership Down Payment Assistance Program Other Housing Programs (Please List Each Program & Cost) Affordable Housing Residential & Support Housing External Structure Repairs	143,073	142,327

Internal Structure Repairs Plumbing Repairs Electrical Repairs Heating & Cooling System Cleaning Waste Management Flooring Doors & Windows Security Pest Control Outdoor & Gardening Legal Billing Estimating & Costing Fleet & Transportation Interior Decoration IT Managing Applications			
--	--	--	--

### City Response

Please reference previous spreadsheet containing cost centre information. In addition, in 2003 the City conducted a comprehensive review of all City programs and services. The results of this review are contained in the "Universal Program Review" document. The schedules contained in the report outlined the legislative requirements for providing each program or service.

[http://www.ottawa.ca/city\\_hall/financial/upr/index\\_en.html](http://www.ottawa.ca/city_hall/financial/upr/index_en.html)

### City Response

The City is one of many government and non-government organizations that provide funding to the YSB (a not-for-profit agency).

- Ministry of Children and Youth Services
- Ministry of Children and Youth Services, Youth Justice Division
- Ministry of Finance
- Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care
- Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities
- Government of Canada (Service Canada)
- City of Ottawa
- United Way Ottawa
- Trillium Foundation

The City works in conjunction with the YSB but does not manage the programs. A listing of the various programs and services provided by the YSB can be found on their website.

[http://www.ysb.on.ca/english/index.php?option=com\\_frontpage&Itemid=121](http://www.ysb.on.ca/english/index.php?option=com_frontpage&Itemid=121)

The City's 2010 contribution to the YSB is \$2.8 million which represents approximately 13 per cent of their annual operating budget.

### Follow Up General Question

What we really need is a detailed city budget. **The 2010 Comp Non Comp file has a good format but lacks lower level detail** which would be separate item categories in SAP, so it must be possible to get us a lower level report for each cost centre. For example if we wanted to know what the police spends on printing or office furniture, or what libraries spend on video games, we have no clue. In each department we **listed the costs we are looking for, that would give you an idea of the level of detail we want**. At the moment 20% of our questions are addressed, if we can get detailed costs our satisfaction level will jump to 80%. We will then not be asking staff the impact of a 10% cut in a specific department, as we will have the information to answer that question.

---

## Hydro Ottawa & Ottawa Community Housing

Hydro Ottawa has a separate board, but since it is owned by taxpayers, any spending is reduced dividends for the City and higher user fees. The \$1.05 million "donation" by Hydro Ottawa to a company in Vancouver is reduced revenue for the City. They increase spending yearly, but the public has no input on such a large budget. Council should develop operational efficiency targets for the board, they should also ask Hydro Ottawa / Housing to provide operating and capital costs budgets which are similar in format to the City's budget. While Council cannot force the board to make this information available, staff can send enclosed text to the CEO of Hydro Ottawa / Housing. Please post the response from the Hydro / Housing CEO as the answer from the City.

Dear CEO Hydro Ottawa,

The City of Ottawa is hosting a Financial Summit for its residents; we would like to know what was spent on the following in 2009:

Research, recruitment, training, cost engineering, finance analyst, general reporting, performance measurement, corporate communication and online content, Administration, planning, billing and revenue collection, expenditure management, advertising, executive, printing, office stationary, promotional items, office furniture, computers, procurement, facilities maintenance and cleaning, knowledge management & record keeping, management of federal & provincial legislation, executive, board, usage measurement, distribution network, billing, hydro production, accounting, hr, it, Administration, communication, clean energy investments, legal, fleet, sponsorships & donations, list and cost of each 2010 capital project.

Dear CEO Ottawa Community Housing,

The City of Ottawa is hosting a Financial Summit for its residents; we would like to know what was spent on the following in 2009:

External structure repairs, internal structure repairs, plumbing repairs, electrical repairs, heating & cooling system, cleaning, waste management, flooring, doors & windows, security, pest control, outdoor & gardening, legal, billing, estimating & costing, fleet & transportation, interior decoration, it, managing applications for housing, research, recruitment, training, cost engineering, finance analyst, general reporting, performance measurement, corporate communication and online content, Administration, planning, billing and revenue collection, expenditure management, advertising, executive, printing, office stationary, promotional items, office furniture, computers, procurement, facilities maintenance and cleaning, knowledge management & record keeping, management of federal & provincial legislation, executive, board, usage measurement, distribution network, billing, hydro production, accounting, hr, it, Administration, communication, clean energy investments, legal, fleet, sponsorships & donations, list and cost of each 2010 capital project.

### City Response

The City has indicated that it will not address questions regarding the operations of Ottawa Hydro. OTAG is encouraged to contact Hydro Ottawa directly.

### Follow Up Question Hydro Ottawa

Hydro Ottawa / Housing their combined budgets is likely over \$300 million dollars, any spending means reduced dividends for the City and higher user fees. The \$1.05 million "donation" by Hydro Ottawa to a company in Vancouver is reduced revenue for the City. We asked staff and Councillors on the board to ask Hydro Ottawa to provide operating and capital

---

costs budgets which are similar in format to the City's budget, we can use this to develop operational efficiency targets for the board. We have also asked the city to make the response from the Hydro / Housing CEO Public.

Can you imagine the CEO of CTV having no interest in seeing the budget for companies that they own like A Channel or CFRA? Any funds spent by Hydro Ottawa is lost revenue for the City, we need to see their budget.

We have received the budget for Housing, why would Hydro Ottawa prevent us from seeing what should be a public document?

### Drinking Water, Solid & Liquid Waste

Kindly estimate the cost of providing each service based on the groups below? If there is a 5% cut on this core service, what will be the impact to each cost group?

	Service	operating cost	Total Program
	<b>Drinking Services</b>		
	Water Distribution		
	Fire Hydrants		
	Water Production & Testing		
	Cross Connection Control		
	Water & Sewer Billing		
	Water Usage Measurement		
1	Rural Well Water Testing	51,230	125,833
	<b>Solid Waste</b>		
	Green Bin - transportation		
	Blue Bin- transportation		
	Black Bin- transportation		
	Regular Garbage- transportation		
	Green Bin – other costs		
	Blue Bin – other costs		
	Black Bin – other costs		
	Regular Garbage – other costs		
	Advertising & promotion		
	Garbage Inspection		
	Landfill- Trail Road		
	Landfill- Carp Road		
	Incineration To Energy		
2	Composting	72,734	66,569
	<b>Waste Water Services</b>		
	Sewer System		
	Storm Water System		
	Rural & Agriculture (Storm Water)		
3	Integrated Water	43,991	126,472

## City Response

Decisions with respect to the setting of water rates are made on an annual basis by Council based on the financial requirements to operate the system, to address the maintenance and growth of the infrastructure and to meet all provincial legislative requirements. Depending on a number of factors such as the amount of cash or debt used in the financing of capital works or how storm water costs are funded, the water rates will vary between municipalities.

## Parks, Sports, Recreation

This department has many infamous records; highest non core service operating cost, highest non core service capital cost, highest non core service employee head count, highest fleet costs in the whole city.

We have listed about 44 services and programs; please explain the impact of a 5% cut on each service and any other programs we are not aware of.

Please reduce the fleet expense (\$24 million), over time (1.2 million) & new programs budget by 15% or about \$4 million, what is the impact?

	Service	operating cost	Total Program
24	<b>Parks Recreation Services</b> Museums Billings Estate National Historic Site Cumberland Heritage Village Pinhey's Point Historic Site Community Museums Soccer Fields Ball Diamonds Arenas Pools Recreation Centres Seniors Centres Community Buildings Arts Facilities Lansdowne Park Parks Pine View Municipal Golf Course	99,925	143,697
25	<b>Parks &amp; Sports Buildings &amp; Grounds</b> Aquatics - Maintain Indoor And Outdoor Pools Aquatics - Swimming Instructional Programs Aquatics - Therapeutic And Fitness Programs Aquatics - Drowning Prevention And Safety Aquatics - Aquatic Leadership Programs Aquatics - Introductory/Learn To Aquatic Sports Aquatics - Facilitate Pool And/Or Facility Rentals Arena- Introductory 'Learn To Skate' Arean- Ice Sports Public Skating Instruction Arena- Manage Arena Ice Allocations And Slab Rentals Arenas- Operate Indoor Skate Parks During Summer Months Community Centres- Instructional Recreation Community Centres- Instructional Fitness Community Centres- Instructional Arts Community Centres- Instructional Special Interest Programs Community Centres- Instructional Partnerships With Community Groups Community Centres- Facility Bookings Community Centres- Indoor Programming Community Centres- Meeting Space For Community And Private Groups Community Centres- Manage Public Access To Computers Sportsfields Ball Diamonds		131,507

Parks Outdoor Rinks Wading Pools Beaches Beach Volleyball Programs And Rentals  Facilitate Community Access To Schools Programs For Target Populations Including Integration Services Specialized Programs For Persons With Disabilities Promote Women And Sport Programs Deliver Youth Programming & Outreach Including Youth On The Move Student Employment Opportunities Develop New Programs Provide Emergency Shelter And Coordination Promote Community Recreation Development And Volunteer Support  Maintain Community Gardens Operate Park-Ticipate And Manage Allocation Of Special Events Equipment Park Development And Redevelopment; Deliver Recreation Facility Planning And Development Promote Capital Partnership Development And Funding Manage Capital Budget Development And Business Plan Development Initiate Public-Private Partnerships (P3s) Develop And Implementation Of Customer Service			
--	--	--	--

### City Response

Any questions that deal with policy issues will not elicit staff City Response as setting policy is Council's prerogative. (For example: questions that ask staff to prioritize services are policy questions.)

### Capital Budget

We have identified about \$416 million or about half the \$762 million capital budget for further analysis. If you reduce the budgets below by 10%, that will generate a savings of about 40 million dollars. What impact will that have on service?

In cases with aggregate expenses, please answer by listing the projects to explain the rational. For example an answer like reducing the Transit budget by 10% means 10% fewer buses would be unsuitable. There are about 60 capital projects in Transit and there must be least 20% of the projects that can bear 80% of the reduction. Another example is that a 10% cut in the budget for parks and recreation does not means closing beaches, parks and sports centres. There about 25 capital projects in Parks & Recreation, a similar 20% of projects logic will apply.

The City is spending about \$6 million on 33 roof replacement projects. What is the City's policy for how long a roof will be used before replacement? If we raised or reduced the threshold by 15 years what impact will that have on cost of replacement? What % of the cost are materials and what % is labour?

Description	Cost	Type	Account
Other Transit Services	218,872		
Hydro (2009 figures)	84,400		
Other Parks Recreation Services	22,358		
Growth Transit Garage	17,000	Growth Transit Garage	903780
SE-Citizen-Centric Svcs(e-services/311)	12,000	Strategic Comm	905716
Roofs	6,088		
Light Rail Transit Office	6,000	Growth LRT	905245
Deputy Manager Operations	5,700		
Deputy Manager Public Works	5,407		
SE-CommunityBased Mobile Workforce	5,400	Strategic City Manager	905717
2010 Transitway Stations	4,100	Growth Transit Garage	905492
Renewal O-Train	3,935		

Other Library	3,933		
SE-Smart Energy	2,400	Environment	905733
EnvironmentalRemediation2010	2,000	Renewal Real Estate	905674
LCR-General Government	1,904	Renewal Offices	905609
2010Vehicle&EquipmentPublicWorks	1,825	Growth Traffic	905445
SE-Transforming Fleet Management	1,800	Strategic Roads	905714
BusinessParkPropertiesBuyBack2010	1,800	Renewal Real Estate	905673
RG-LCR-General Government	1,710	Renewal Offices	905661
Childcare	1396		
MinorParkImprovements2010	650	Renewal Parks, Recreation	904934
SE-Integrating Community & SocialSvcs	600	Strategic Emp & Fin Assis	905718
By-Law & Regulatory Services	562		
Tree Planting Initiative	500	Strategic Trees	904455
GreenFleet	500	Strategic Fleet Services	905470
Collections2010	500	Growth Library	905631
Lifecyle Renewal - Tree Program	446	Renewal Trees	905450
Two-Way Radio Replacement	400	Renewal Road Operations	905442
SE-Sponsorship & Advertizing	300	Strategic Sponsorship	905734
SE-In.Business/mgmt/oppractices(PW)	300	Strategic Roads	905715
Transit Communications	275	Renewal Transit	905160
Lifecycle Renewal-Salt Storage Facilities	250	Renewal Road Operations	903394
Minor Facility Improvements	250	Renewal Parks, Recreation	905712
CorporateRadioSystem-2010	245	Renewal Radio	905472
Parks & Facility Signage	150	Strategic Parks, Recreation	903918
Development Charge Bylaw Review 2014	150	Growth By Law	905384
Planning Branch (Construction, Rural)	150		
ITStrategicPlanRefresh2010	120	Renewal IT	905720
IT Performance Measurement(TCO)2010	100	Renewal IT	905709
2010ParkingStudies	50	Renewal Pedestrian	905447
Growth Planning Studies	50	Growth Library	905624
2010AudibleSignalProgram	45	Strategic Roads	905457
	<b>416,621</b>		
<b>About \$6 million on 33 Roof Replacement Projects</b>			
Parks	2012		
Transit	1410		
Fire	1370		
Transportation	746		
Long Term Care	470		
Social Housing	50		
Childcare	30		

---

### **City Response:**

#### 1. General capital program spending:

In developing the 2010 capital budget requirements, staff has provided their best estimates in order to deliver the Council directed projects to address the rehabilitation and growth needs in the City. The justification for the capital spending was included in the supplementary capital budget document provided to Council during their budget 2010 deliberations. This document can be referenced on the web.

[http://www.ottawa.ca/city\\_hall/budget/budget\\_2010/adopted\\_supplemental\\_capital\\_budget\\_2010.pdf](http://www.ottawa.ca/city_hall/budget/budget_2010/adopted_supplemental_capital_budget_2010.pdf) [ PDF - 5.21 MB ]

#### 2. Service Excellence (SE) Initiatives:

Projects listed in the OTAG schedule include investments in new technologies have been approved in 2010 to address service excellence objectives which will result in future operational efficiencies and savings. Decreasing the budgetary allocations will either reduce the amount of work that can be done during the year, jeopardize the ability of staff to complete projects or delay the implementation of new technologies designed to generate efficiencies and savings. Council received a report on the Service Excellence Strategy in November 2009, as part of the background information on the 2010 budget. This document can be referenced at:

<http://www.ottawa.ca/calendar/ottawa/citycouncil/abfc/2009/11-17/12%20-%20ACS2009-COS-ODP-0015.htm>

#### 3. Renewal:

Capital projects for infrastructure renewal that are included on the schedule are necessary to close the infrastructure renewal gap that was highlighted as part of the City's Long Range financial planning and that forms part of the fiscal framework. Council has set targets for closing that gap. Reducing the amount spent on infrastructure renewal will result in a further deferral of works required to maintain the City's infrastructure. The LRFP and 2007 Fiscal Framework can be referenced at

[http://www.ottawa.ca/city\\_hall/financial/lrfp3/index\\_en.html](http://www.ottawa.ca/city_hall/financial/lrfp3/index_en.html)  
[http://www.ottawa.ca/city\\_hall/financial/fiscal\\_2007\\_en.html](http://www.ottawa.ca/city_hall/financial/fiscal_2007_en.html)

### **City Response**

Any questions that deal with policy issues will not elicit staff City Response as setting policy is Council's prerogative. (For example: questions that ask staff to prioritize services are policy questions.)

### **City Response**

#### **Roof replacement:**

Replacements are based on an annual assessment of our facilities, and take into consideration the life of the infrastructure in accordance with sound asset management practices.

#### **Follow Up Question Capital Costs**

The justification for each capital project does not show the impact of a 10% cut. For example if we cut the budget for the bus garage or mobile workforce or tree planting or transit communication of facility signage by 10% what will be the impact? Cages instead of solid metal doors etc we spent a lot of time reviewing all capital projects and identifying those that could do with 10% less money, it is unfortunate that our question was not addressed.

#### **Roads & Other Core Service Operating Costs**

Kindly estimate the cost of providing each service based on the groups below? If there is a 5% cut of the following core services, kindly let us know the impact in each cost group?

---

NB: Since our focus is reducing expenses, please do not reduce the total cost by revenue. There is a difference between the total program cost and the operating cost. We presume that this is mainly due to user fees, however in Traffic and Parking operations the operating cost is much higher than the total program cost, is this because some of the program costs are included under other headings?

	Service	operating cost	Total Program
11	Surface Operations - Integrated Road & Water	135,886	125,701
12	Engineering & Technical Services		13,916
13	Transportation Services Rural & Agriculture		
14	Transportation Services		
15	Traffic & Parking Operations Off Street Parking On Street Parking Tour Bus Parking Bike Parking Motorcycle And Scooter Parking Motor Home Parking Area Traffic Management Program Active And Alternative Transportation Facilities Traffic Network Management Right-Of-Way, Permits, By-Laws And Inspections Traffic Safety, Investigation And Studies Parking Operations Street Lighting Red Light Cameras Traffic Control Signals Pavement Markings, Signage And Road Safety Devices	42,659	14,026
16	Building Code Services Small Homeowner Project (Decks And Porches) Small Homeowner Project (Additions, Basement, Renovations) Detached, Semi-Detached, Town And Row Houses Small Buildings Small Farm Buildings Large Buildings Large Farm Buildings Complex Buildings	15,673	15,306

### City Response

Any questions that deal with policy issues will not elicit staff City Response as setting policy is Council's prerogative. (For example: questions that ask staff to prioritize services are policy questions.)

### Other Operating Costs Non Core Services

If there is a 10% cut in non core service expense of about \$185 million (service 23-50), this will yield about \$18 million in savings, kindly let us know the impact in each cost group?

	Service	operating cost	Total Program
--	---------	----------------	---------------

26	<b>French Language Services</b> Bilingualism Policy French Language Services Division French Language Services Advisory Committee Complaints Regarding French Language Services Business Assistance Project History Of Ottawa's French-Speaking Community New!		
27	Committee Of Adjustment		944
28	<b>Infrastructure Services</b> Infrastructure Approvals Infrastructure Review Of Development Applications Infrastructure Comments On Committee Of Adjustment Ap. City-Initiated Capital Projects For Growth-Related Servicing And Road Infrastructure Developer Constructed Growth-Related Servicing And Road Infrastructure Revise Estimates And Update Capital Project Forecasts Development Charges Tracking System  Master Plans For Transportation Piped Utilities And Storm Water Management Environmental Assessments Pursue Funding Sources Administration Agreements Relating To Infrastructure Funding Programs Rural Servicing And Groundwater Initiatives Infrastructure Policy Development E.G. Cow On Roof Top	5,666	26,417
29	Transportation Planning		3,346
30	<b>Building Code Services - Other Permits &amp; Compl Rep</b> Development Approvals Review Heritage Applications Initiate Heritage Studies Designations Manage The Heritage Grant Program Planning Comments On Committee Of Adjustment Applications Interpretation Of Development Policies And By-Laws City Zoning By-Laws And Official Plans Graphic And Mapping Services	619	
31	<b>Cultural Services &amp; Community Funding</b> Wetlands Conservation Land Tax Incentive Program (Cltip) Affordable Housing Funding Arts Funding Program Brownfields Redevelopment Program Building Permit Grant For Farmers Community Environmental Grants Program (Cepgp) Community Funding Community Partnership Major Capital Program Community Partnership Minor Capital Program Community Tree Planting Grant Program Green Acres - Ottawa's Rural Reforestation Program Heritage Funding Program Heritage Grant Program For Building Restoration Homelessness Initiatives Funding Program Evaluation Toolkit Protective Plumbing Devices Grants Recreation And Culture Fee Assistance Program Rural Association Partnership Program Rural Clean Water Program Toilet Replacement Program	45,268	
33	<b>IT Services</b> Please Provide Cost Sub Groups  <b>Online Services</b> 123 Goregister! Register And Pay For Recreation And Cultural Programs Calendar Of Events - Spotlight City Council & Committee Agendas & Minutes City Forms	46,441	45,125

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Collection Calendar</li> <li>Customer Service Feedback Form - Accessibility</li> <li>Development Application Search</li> <li>Lexis Terminology Database</li> <li>Maps</li> <li>Media Advisories, News Releases &amp; Public Service Announcements</li> <li>Online Store</li> <li>Ottawa Public Library Complete List Of Services</li> <li>Parking Ticket Payment</li> <li>Payment Of Water &amp; Tax Bills With E-Post</li> <li>Request For City Of Ottawa Documentation In Accessible Format</li> <li>Traffic Tickets And Other Provincial Offences Payments</li> <li>Traffic Web Cams</li> <li>Update Your Child's Immunization Record</li> <li>Water Billing</li> </ul>		
34	It Productivity Driven		
35	<b>Fleet Services</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Parks &amp; Sports Buildings &amp; Grounds 24,327</li> <li>IT Productivity Driven 8,026</li> <li>Service Excellence Program 6,429</li> <li>Planning Branch (Construction, Rural) 5,918</li> <li>Transit 4,641</li> <li>Drinking Services 3,995</li> <li>Traffic &amp; Parking Operations 2,038</li> <li>Waste Water Services 1,547</li> <li>Crime Prevention 1,038</li> <li>Building Code Services 966</li> <li>Planning &amp; Growth Management 566</li> <li>Ottawa Public Library 405</li> <li>Employment &amp; Financial Assistance 235</li> <li>IT Services 167</li> <li>Deputy Manager Operating Resource 151</li> <li>Infrastructure Services 110</li> <li>Long Term Care 97</li> <li>City Manager 86</li> <li>City Clerk &amp; Legal 86</li> <li>Deputy Manager Operations 56</li> <li>Office of Emergency Management 55</li> <li>Ottawa Fire Services 46</li> <li>Real Property Asset Management 29</li> <li>Legal Services 7</li> </ul>	654	61,005
36	Forestry Services (Public Works)		10,062
37	Planning Branch (Construction, Rural)		3,324
38	<b>Planning &amp; Growth Management</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Official Plan</li> <li>City-Wide And Area-Specific Physical Land Use</li> <li>Community Design Plans</li> <li>Urban Design Initiatives</li> <li>Street Design And Streets Caping Plans</li> <li>Affordable Housing Initiatives</li> <li>Community Planning Workshops</li> <li>Demographic And Employment Research</li> <li>Zoning By-Law</li> </ul>	14,521	20,780
40	<b>Economic &amp; Environmental Sustainability</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>OCR1</li> <li>List Other Agencies And Budget For Each One</li> <li>Negotiate Public-Private Partnership (P3s)</li> <li>Agreements For The Provision Of Key Municipal</li> <li>Small Business Development</li> <li>Rural Economic Development</li> <li>Business Sector/Cluster Development</li> <li>Broadband Connectivity</li> <li>Targeted Events Attraction And Marketing</li> <li>Light Rail Office:</li> <li>Request For Proposals Submissions</li> <li>Select Preferred Proponent And Negotiate Contract</li> <li>Contribution Agreements With Senior Levels Of Government</li> <li>Construction Business Facilitation:</li> </ul>	6,696	3,530

	Market Data And Analysis External Marketing And Investment Attraction Tourism Labour Force And Skills Development		
41	<b>Environmental Sustainability</b>  Wetlands Conservation Monitor Environmental Issues Area-Based Environmental Studies (E.G. Subwatershed Studies) Environmental Programs (List With Cost Of Each Program) City And Conservation Authorities' Activities Public Awareness Campaigns – Climate Change Public Awareness Campaigns – Air Quality & Smog Public Awareness Campaigns – Energy Conservation Public Awareness Campaigns - Pesticides		2,355
42	<b>Employee Services</b>  Recruitment Training Health & Safety Labour Relations / Negotiate Collective Agreements Career Management Hr Policy Performance Measurement Human Rights & Employment Equity Payroll Services: Administration Approximately \$370 Million In Employer And Employee Third Party Employee Reimbursements Programs System Enhancement Testing Pension And Benefit Programs Job Evaluation & Position Management Corporate Reporting	20,831	14,666
43	Organizational Development & Performance		6,036
44	<b>Communications &amp; Customer Service</b>  Communications Planning Graphic Design Writing Editing Photography Project Management Web Media Content Paid Media Content Earned Media Content Distribution Of Print Material  Media Buying Corporate Accessibility Program: Service Integration And Improvement Initiatives Analyze Client Feedback, Web Statistics, Intelligence From Contact Centre Intelligence From Client Service Centres Intelligence From Ottawa.Ca Intelligence From E-Mail Services.  Client Service Centres Products And Services Birth Registrations And Traveling With A Newborn Building Permit Applications Cat & Dog Registration Civil Marriage Ceremonies Commissioner Of Oaths Death Registrations And Burial Permits Development Applications Marriage Licenses Oc Transpo Bus Tickets And Passes Open-Air Fire Permit Parking Cards Parking Permits And Lots Parking Ticket Payment	12,462	11,446

	Property Assessment Information Property Tax Payment Recreation And Registration Information Water Bill Payment Water Well Testing Zoning Information  City Archives		
45	Service Excellence Program	1,654	
46	<b>Legal Services</b>  Procedural And Legal Advice To Elected Representatives Preparation And Execution Of Development Agreements Conduct And Supervise Litigation By And Against The City Real Estate Legal Services Drafting And Reviewing Of Corporate And Commercial Contracts, Leases And Agreements: Advocacy Before Labour Relation, Human Rights And Employment-Related Tribunals And Courts Prosecution Of Municipal By-Laws And Provincial Offences Official Plan And Zoning Amendments Review Preparation And Delivery Of Preventative Law Programs	6,813	
47	<b>Financial Services</b>  Budget / Annual Financial Statement Treasury Management Risk Management Debt Management Financial Processing Departmental Support Periodic Reporting Bia Reporting Federal Accountability Provincial Accountability 3 <sup>rd</sup> Party Benchmarking Reports Asset Management Liabilities Management Process Supplier's Invoices City's Credit Card Program Financial Processes Sales Tax Returns Inventory Management Preparation Of Bid Solicitations Award Of Contract Legal And Employment Agreements Public-Private Partnerships (P3s) Corporate Fleet Transit Fleet Fuel Supplies Other Equipment Services Obsolete Inventory Property Taxation Water Billing Provincial Offence Notices And Parking Fines Pre-Authorized Payment Plan Payment-In-Lieu Of Taxes Revenue Administration Tax Rebate Programs	31,021	41,721

48	<p><b>Real Property Asset Management</b></p> <p>Planning, Policy &amp; Standards  Evaluation/Performance Measurement Frameworks  Cost-Effective Real Property Asset Inventory  Asset Rationalization Reports,  Property Solution Option Analyses,  Public-Private Partnership (P3) Initiatives  Property Management Services- Pools  Property Management Services- Arenas  Property Management Services- Daycares  Property Management Services- Home For The Aged  Legislative Compliance And Risk Management;  Preventative Maintenance And Repair Of Buildings  Programming For Venture Properties (I.E. Lansdowne Park And Lynx Stadium,  Byward And Parkdale Markets)</p> <p>Acquisition And Lease-In Of Real Property  Properties Being Held For Future Infrastructure Projects  Properties Surplus To Programming Requirements  Sell Or Lease Of Property Surplus  Appraisals  Manage Cash-In-Lieu Of Parkland Program  Environmental Management  Inventory Of City Real Estate Assets;  Policy And Standards</p> <p>Design And Construction Services  Architecture  Building Engineering  Landscape Architecture  Accommodation  Technical Advice Feasibility Studies  Cost Estimates  Project Schedules  Energy Management Services  Utility Procurement And Tracking  Building Systems Engineering And Automation  Energy Audits,  Retrofits  Management Of Energy Performance Contracts  Space Planning  Design  Fit-Up  Move Coordination  Furniture Purchasing  Park Construction</p> <p>Security Services:  Protect Elected Officials, Staff, Clients And Visitors  Protect Corporate Assets And Facilities  Emergency Response  Threat And Risk Analysis  Internal Security Investigations  Policy/Standards  Building Security Contract Management</p>	57,060	7,236
49	Corporate Planning & Performance Reporting	1,158	

50	<p><b>City Clerk</b></p> <p>Elected Representatives' Support Municipal Act Interpretation</p> <p>Council And Committee Services: Standing Committees Advisory Committees Sub-Committees</p> <p>Elections &amp; Municipal Elections Act Municipal Freedom Of Information &amp; Protection Of Privacy Act Personal Health Information Protection Act</p> <p>Office Of Protocol Study Tours Visiting Delegations Presentations To Council Flag Raisings Courtesy Calls Proclamations</p> <p>Courthouse And Provincial Offence Services Printing Services Mail Services</p> <p>Volunteer Services Volunteer Registry Database Volunteer Marketplace Events Civic Appreciation Awards Volunteer Training Sessions Excellence Award Events</p> <p>City Archives</p>		
		15,880	28,864

### City Response

A large portion of the information being requested for each of the services does not exist in the City's financial system. For instance, in the case of Paramedics, the City does not budget on the basis of events such as fire rescues, water rescues and industrial accidents. These are events that may occur during the course of the year to which Paramedics may respond.

To address this information request, staff has provided a listing from the City's financial system of all the departments / branches and the cost centres that contain the budget for the various services. For each cost centre we have shown the compensation costs, non compensation costs and revenues (if applicable).

2010 Comp Non  
Comp Rev.xls

In areas where information on "office jobs" is being requested, the following is a link to the City's 2009 FTE Analysis report that was submitted to Council in November 2009. A listing of all positions within City departments / branches is provided in the report.

<http://ottawa.ca/calendar/ottawa/citycouncil/abfc/2009/11-17/10 - REVISED ACS2009-COS-HRS-0002 2009 FTE Analysis Report Nov 2 2009 English.htm>

### City Response

Any questions that deal with policy issues will not elicit staff City Response as setting policy is Council's prerogative. (For example: questions that ask staff to prioritize services are policy questions.)

### City Response

---

Any questions that deal with policy issues will not elicit staff City Response as setting policy is Council's prerogative. (For example: questions that ask staff to prioritize services are policy questions.)

**City Response**

Please reference previous spreadsheet containing cost centre information.

**City Response**

The 2010 revenues projected to be generated from parking operations are approximately \$14m (primarily from parking meters and parking lots) and fully fund the operating costs of \$14m including a contribution to the City's Parking Reserve Fund. These funds are used to finance parking related capital works such as parking structure rehabilitation. Staff cannot determine the source of the "Operating Cost" of \$42.659m as presented on the OTAG link. The "Total Program Cost" of \$14.026m as contained in the OTAG link is the 2010 operating budget. The same is true of all other services listed in the OTAG link - staff cannot determine the source of the "Operating Cost" number while the "Total Program Cost" represents the 2010 budget for the service.